



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization

Organisation  
des Nations Unies  
pour l'éducation,  
la science et la culture

# World Heritage

# 43 COM

WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add

Paris, 7 June 2019

Original: English / French

## UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

### CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

#### WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Forty-third session

Baku, Republic of Azerbaijan  
30 June - 10 July 2019

#### **Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda: Establishment of the World Heritage List and of the List of World Heritage in Danger**

#### **8B. Nominations to the World Heritage List**

#### SUMMARY

This Addendum is divided into four sections:

- I. Examination of nominations referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee
- II. Examination of minor boundary modifications of natural, mixed and cultural properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List
- III. Statements of Outstanding Universal Value of properties inscribed at previous sessions and not adopted by the World Heritage Committee
- IV. Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of Maloti-Drakensberg Park (Lesotho/South Africa), Decision 41 COM 7B.38

#### Decisions required:

The Committee is requested to examine the Draft Decisions presented in this Document, and, in accordance with paragraphs 153, 161 and 162 of the *Operational Guidelines*, take its Decisions concerning inscription on the World Heritage List in the following four categories:

- (a) properties which it **inscribes** on the World Heritage List;
- (b) properties which it decides **not to inscribe** on the World Heritage List;
- (c) properties whose consideration is **referred**;
- (d) properties whose consideration is **deferred**.

In the presentation below, ICOMOS Recommendations and IUCN Recommendations are presented in the form of Draft Decisions and are extracted from WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add (ICOMOS) and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B2.Add (IUCN).

Though Draft Decisions were taken from IUCN and ICOMOS evaluation books, in some cases, a few modifications were required to adapt them to this document.

#### Disclaimer

The Nomination files produced by the States Parties are published by the World Heritage Centre at its website and/or in working documents in order to ensure transparency, access to information and to facilitate the preparations of comparative analysis by other nominating States Parties.

The sole responsibility for the content of each Nomination file lies with the State Party concerned. The publication of the Nomination file does not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever of the World Heritage Committee or of the Secretariat of UNESCO concerning the history or legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its boundaries.

## I. EXAMINATION OF NOMINATIONS REFERRED BACK BY PREVIOUS SESSIONS OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Property	<b>Kaeng Krachan Forest Complex</b>
ID No.	<b>1461 Rev</b>
State Party	<b>Thailand</b>
Criteria proposed by State Party	<b>(x)</b>

See IUCN Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 3.

#### **Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.5**

*The World Heritage Committee,*

1. *Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B2.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decisions 39 COM 8B.5 and 40 COM 8B.11 adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015) and 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) sessions respectively,*
3. *Defers the examination of the nomination of **Kaeng Krachan Forest Complex, Thailand**, to the World Heritage List under criterion (x);*
4. *Recommends that the State Party consider resubmission of the nomination in the format of a new nomination, after:*
  - a) *Concerns regarding rights have been resolved, in full consultation with the affected indigenous peoples and local communities, and to the satisfaction of the United Nations Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights. This process should ensure that the requirements of the Operational Guidelines are fully met regarding the need to demonstrate that the free,*

*prior and informed consent of indigenous peoples for the nomination has been obtained,*

- b) *A revised comparative analysis has been completed, demonstrating that the reduced area of the nominated property would be sufficient to meet criterion (x) and potentially also criterion (ix), including the related conditions of integrity;*

5. *Continues to encourage the States Parties of Thailand and Myanmar to collaborate in transboundary conservation and management of the highly significant nature conservation values of the region, and to evaluate the potential to bring forward a further nomination on a transboundary basis.*

Property	<b>Historic Centre of Sheki with the Khan's Palace</b>
ID No.	<b>1549 Rev</b>
State Party	<b>Azerbaijan</b>
Criteria proposed by State Party	<b>(ii)(iii)(iv)(v)</b>

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 1.

#### **Technical Note**

Some maps, including related references, as well as denominations within the nomination file as put forward by the State Party may raise questions of historical accuracy.

#### **Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.36**

*The World Heritage Committee,*

1. *Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,*
2. *Recalling Decision 41 COM 8B.20 adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017) and noting that no new information related to the potential significance of the site has been submitted which would have allowed ICOMOS to reassess this aspect of the site,*
3. *Decides not to inscribe the **Historic centre of Sheki with the Khan's Palace, Azerbaijan**, on the World Heritage List.*

Property	<b>Le Colline del Prosecco di Conegliano e Valdobbiadene</b>
ID No.	<b>1571 Rev</b>
State Party	<b>Italy</b>
Criteria proposed by State Party	<b>(v)</b>

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 12.

#### **Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.37**

*The World Heritage Committee,*

1. *Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,*

2. **Inscribes Le Colline del Prosecco di Conegliano e Valdobbiadene, Italy, on the World Heritage List as a cultural landscape on the basis of criterion (v);**
3. **Adopts** the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

**Brief synthesis**

The Colline del Prosecco di Conegliano e Valdobbiadene in northeast Italy is an area characterised by distinctive hogback morphological system which provides a distinctive mountain character with scenic vistas, and an organically evolved and continuing landscape comprised of vineyards, forests, small villages and agriculture. For centuries, the harsh terrain has both shaped and been adapted by distinctive land use practices. They include the land and soil conservation techniques that comprise the viticultural practices using Glera grapes to produce the highest quality Prosecco wine. Since the 17th century, the use of the ciglioni – the patterned use of grassy terraces used to cultivate areas with steep slopes – has created a distinctive chequerboard pattern with rows parallel and vertical to the slopes. In the 19th century, the specific training of the vines known as bellussera, was developed by local farmers, contributing to the aesthetic characteristics of the landscape. The mosaic appearance of the landscape is a result of historical and ongoing environmental and land use practices. The plots dedicated to vineyards, established on ciglioni, coexist with forest patches, small woodlands, hedges, and rows of trees that serve as corridors connecting different habitats. In the hogbacks, small villages are scattered along the narrow valleys or perched on the crests.

**Criterion (v):** The Colline del Prosecco di Conegliano e Valdobbiadene is a viticulture landscape resulting from the interaction of nature and people over several centuries. The adaptation and transformation of the challenging terrain of the hogback geomorphology has required the development of specific land use practices, including: vineyard management by hand on steep slopes; the grassy terraces known as ciglioni, which follow the contours of the land, stabilising the soils and vineyards; and the bellussera training system which was developed in the area about 1880. As a result, the vineyards contribute to a distinctive ‘chequerboard’ appearance with perpendicular rows of high vines, interspersed with rural settlements, forests and small woods. Despite many changes, the history of sharecropping in this area is also reflected in the landscape patterns.

**Integrity**

The boundary of the property is of adequate size, and contains the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value within a topographically distinct and intact landform. Despite many changes and challenges posed by pests, wars, poverty, and the industrialisation of viticulture, many of the attributes such as the vineyards, ciglioni and architectural elements demonstrate a good state of conservation, and the patches of forest have been maintained. Ecological processes are critically important for the sustainability of the landscape and the vineyards.

Threats are currently managed, although the state of conservation of some elements (particularly architectural and urban elements in the buffer zone) require improvement, and climate change has accentuated the incidence of landslides. The landscape could be vulnerable to irreversible change due to the pressures of production of Prosecco within a growing global market. Agricultural and viticultural techniques for maintaining the integrity of the landscape are continuing, including manual harvesting.

**Authenticity**

The main attributes of the property relate to the distinctive landscape, where nature and human history have shaped and been shaped by an adapted and specific system for viticulture and land use. Despite many changes, the attributes demonstrate authenticity, and are documented through sources such as inventories and cadasters, historical and religious paintings, and historical documents that demonstrate the introduction of the ciglioni, and the operation of the sharecropping system from the first land registries in the 18th century.

**Protection and management requirements**

The property and its attributes are subject to protection measures at national and local levels; and municipalities and professional associations have introduced additional safeguards through territorial planning tools and the formation of legal and voluntary charters. The protection of the rural landscape is primarily guaranteed by the rules of the Conegliano Valdobbiadene Prosecco Superiore DOCG that favour the maintenance of the vineyards, ciglioni and other attributes that are fundamental for maintaining local traditions and to the protection of the agricultural biodiversity and associated ecosystem services.

Almost all of the property has been nominated to the National Register of Historical Rural Landscapes, a programme developed by the Ministry of Agriculture for the protection of agricultural rural landscapes. The forest vegetation is protected by the forest restrictions included in the National Code for Cultural Heritage, as well as by the management plan of the Site of Community Interest (SCI) of the EU Natura 2000 network applicable to the area. The buildings of historical and monumental value are all protected at national level by the Codice dei Beni Culturali e del Paesaggio (Cultural Heritage and Landscape Code) issued by Legislative Decree No. 42, 22 January 2004, along with all public buildings, state property and church-owned buildings that are more than 50 years old. The legal protection could be further strengthened through the implementation of the Detailed Landscape Plan (Piano Paesaggistico di Dettaglio) (PPD) at the regional level; the implementation of Intermunicipal regulation of rural police (Regolamento intercomunale di polizia rurale); and the full implementation of the ‘Technical rule - Articolo unico’ in all relevant municipalities.

The management of the site is primarily linked to the plans and planning processes developed by the local authorities – the Veneto Region and the

Treviso Province – which support and guarantee the participation of all stakeholders through a specific Regional Law (No. 45/2017). Construction of new production areas and buildings in the agricultural zone that are not strictly necessary for the working of agricultural land is not permitted. **The Management Plan requires further development, adoption and implementation.**

4. **Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:**

- a) Clarifying the extent of the Commitment Area (in hectares),
- b) Providing detailed mapping and inventories of the attributes of the property (particularly the vernacular, historic or modern architecture and settlements), with a clear distinction of the contents of the property and the buffer zone, and including inventories of flora and fauna,
- c) Establishing as a priority, a detailed condition assessment of all the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value, and incorporating this into the management system and monitoring arrangements,
- d) Expanding the description of the present-day socio-economic system in relation to its history as part of the management and planning for the long-term sustainability of the cultural landscape,
- e) Identifying and planning for the improvement of visually detrimental infrastructure, settlements and industrial facilities in the buffer zone (particularly to the north of the property and in the plain),
- f) Improving the state of conservation of buildings in the property and buffer zone – particularly the vernacular architecture – based on a thorough inventory and condition assessment,
- g) Improving the documentation of the contributions to the landscape character by historical and current forest management,
- h) **Further developing the monitoring system by adding indicators for the assessment of the state of conservation and the biodiversity of the property.**
- i) Further strengthening the protection for the landscape through implementation of the Detailed Landscape Plan (Piano Paesaggistico di Dettaglio) (PPD) at the regional level, the implementation of Intermunicipal regulation of rural police (Regolamento intercomunale di polizia rural), and through the implementation of the recently finalised adoption of the 'Technical Rule – Articolo unico' by all relevant municipalities,
- j) Fully including the property in the National Register of Historical Rural Landscapes, and fully incorporate its rules into the management system,
- k) Further developing and finalising the management plan,

- l) Developing sustainable tourism planning based on an approach which incorporates the property, buffer zone and Commitment Area, giving attention to the quality and consistency of new tourism facilities and infrastructure,
- m) **Enhancing the involvement of local communities in the management structures, and ensuring that local benefits flow from tourism and sustainable development strategies,**
- n) Ensuring that all new developments – including tourism infrastructure and wind or solar power installations in the buffer zone – are subject to rigorous Heritage Impact Assessment processes that consider their potential impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and its setting prior to their approval.

Property	<b>The 20th-Century Architecture of Frank Lloyd Wright</b>
ID No.	<b>1496 Rev</b>
State Party	<b>United States of America</b>
Criteria proposed by State Party	<b>(ii)</b>

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 23.

**Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.38**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Inscribes **The 20th-Century Architecture of Frank Lloyd Wright, United States of America, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (ii);**

**Brief synthesis**

The 20th-Century Architecture of Frank Lloyd Wright focusses upon the influence that the work of architect, had, not only in his country, the United States of America, but more importantly, on architecture of the 20th century and upon the recognized masters of the Modern Movement in architecture in Europe. The qualities of what is known as 'Organic Architecture' developed by Wright, including the open plan, the blurring between exterior and interior, the new uses of materials and technologies and the explicit responses to the suburban and natural settings of the various buildings, have been acknowledged as pivotal in the development of modern architectural design in the 20th century.

The property includes a series of eight buildings designed and built over the first half of the 20th century; each component has specific characteristics, representing new solutions to the needs for housing, worship, work, education and leisure. The diversity of functions, scale and setting of the components of the series fully illustrate the architectural principles of "organic architecture".

The buildings employ geometric abstraction and spatial manipulation as a response to functional and emotional needs and are based literally or

figuratively on nature's forms and principles. In adapting inspirations from global cultures, they break free of traditional forms and facilitate modern life. Wright's solutions would go on to influence architecture and design throughout the world, and continue to do so to this day.

The components of the series include houses both grand and modest (including the consummate example of a "Prairie" house and the prototype "Usonian" house); a place of worship; a museum; and complexes of the architect's own homes with studio and education facilities. These buildings are located variously in city, suburban, forest, and desert environments. The substantial range of function, scale, and setting in the series underscores both the consistency and the wide applicability of those principles. Each has been specifically recognized for its individual influence, which also contributes uniquely to the elaboration of this original architectural language.

Such features, related to innovation are subordinated to designs that integrate form, materials, technology, furnishings, and setting into a unified whole. Each building is uniquely fitted to the needs of its owner and its function and, though designed by the same architect, each has a very different character and appearance, reflecting a deep respect and appreciation for the individual and the particular. Together, these buildings illustrate the full range of this architectural language, which is a singular contribution to global architecture in spatial, formal, material, and technological terms.

The Outstanding Universal Value of the serial property is conveyed through attributes such as spatial continuity expressed through the open plan and blurred transitions between interior and exterior spaces; dynamic forms that employ innovative structural methods and an inventive use of new materials and technologies; design inspired by nature's forms and principles; integral relationship with nature; primacy of the individual and individualized expression and transforming inspirations from other places and cultures.

**Criterion (ii):** The 20th-Century Architecture of Frank Lloyd Wright demonstrates an important interchange in the discourse that changed architecture on a global scale during the first half of the 20th century. The eight components illustrate different aspects of Wright's new approach to architecture consciously developed for an American context; the resulting buildings, however, were in fact suited to modern life in many countries, and in their fusion of spirit and form they evoked emotional responses that were universal in their appeal. Reacting against prevailing styles in the United States, this approach took advantage of new materials and technologies, but was also inspired by principles of the natural world and was nurtured by other cultures and eras. These innovative ideas and the resulting unified architectural works were noted in European architectural and critical circles early in the century and influenced several of the trends and architects of the European Modern Movement in architecture. Wright's influence is also noticeable in

the work of some architects in Latin America, Australia and Japan.

### **Integrity**

The serial property contains all the elements necessary to express its Outstanding Universal Value since it encompasses the works generally understood by critics and other architects to have been most influential. Each component highlights a different aspect of the attributes that demonstrate this influence and contributes to illustrating different aspects of the Outstanding Universal Value in a defined and discernible way, and to reflect clear cultural and architectural links. As an ensemble, they prove to have exerted an influence on architecture over the first half of the 20th century.

The boundaries of each of the components include all the key elements to express their significance, although a minor boundaries modification in Taliesin, to include all the structures and gardens designed by Wright, would allow a better understanding of the whole property. The boundaries in components located in relation to wider natural settings allow an accurate representation of the relationships between the buildings and their surroundings. The components of the serial property include the buildings and interior furniture and all are overall adequately protected; none suffers from adverse effects of development or neglect. Each building has benefited from careful and comprehensive conservation studies and expert technical advice to ensure a high level of preservation.

### **Authenticity**

Most of the components of the serial property have remained remarkably unchanged since their construction in their form and design, use and function, materials and substance, spirit and feeling. Conservation of each of the buildings, when needed to correct long-term structural issues or repair deterioration, has been in accordance with high standards of professional practice, ensuring the long-term conservation of original fabric wherever possible, and the significant features of each site; in all cases work has been based on exceptionally complete documentation. Very few features have been modified; the changes and replacements of material component parts must be understood as a means of retaining their forms and uses. In cases where the original function has changed, the current use is fully consistent with the original design.

The relationship between the sites and their settings is in general acceptable; the residential low density areas where some of the buildings are located has not experimented drastic changes in scale over time, although this is an aspect that must be considered in the protection and management systems. In the case of buildings located in natural settings, only Taliesin West poses some problems because of the expansion of the city of Scottsdale.

### **Protection and management requirements**

Each property has been designated by the United States Department of the Interior as an individual National Historic Landmark, which gives it, under federal law, the highest level of protection. One of

the components of the series is owned by a local government; the others are privately owned by non-profit organizations, foundations and an individual. Each building is protected from alterations, demolitions, and other inappropriate changes through deed restrictions, local preservation ordinances and zoning laws, private conservation easements, and state law. Active conservation measures have been carried out for all of the components.

Each site has an effective management system that makes use of a suite of planning and conservation guidance. The management coordination body is the Frank Lloyd Wright World Heritage Council, established in 2012 via a Memorandum of Agreement between the Frank Lloyd Wright Building Conservancy and the owners and/or representatives of the owners of the individual component properties. The Frank Lloyd Wright Building Conservancy, an NGO with offices in Chicago organized for the purpose of preserving and protecting the remaining works of Frank Lloyd Wright, coordinates the work of the Council. Since the Council has an advisory capacity, its role in the decision making process should be strengthened.

The development and implementation of management plans for those components which do not already have them is recommended; risk preparedness and visitor management must be considered for all of the components of the serial property.

Key indicators to monitor the state of conservation of the buildings according to their specific characteristics have been identified; they are mostly related to buildings materials and, in the cases of Fallingwater and Taliesin West, to landscape features. The indicators, though, are not directly related to the attributes proposed by the State Party to convey the Outstanding Universal Value of the serial property.

4. Encourages the State Party to proceed to the extension of the series in the future, when the conditions for the additional components are established.
3. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
    - a) Considering the possibility of minor boundary modifications of the area in Taliesin in order to encompass all the structures designed by Frank Lloyd Wright,
    - b) Strengthening the protection of the setting of the Robie House, in particular to control potential development impact in Woodlawn Garden, by considering the possibility of a minor boundary modification of the buffer zone,
    - c) Strengthening the capacity of the Frank Lloyd Wright World Heritage Council in order to ensure the appropriate coordinated management of the serial property,
    - d) Elaborating upon and implementing management plans for those individual components where they do not exist, in order to encapsulate the existing conservation and management instruments in place, including risk and visitors management;

## II. EXAMINATION OF MINOR BOUNDARY MODIFICATIONS OF NATURAL, MIXED AND CULTURAL PROPERTIES ALREADY INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST

### Alphabetical Summary Table and Index of Recommendations by ICOMOS and IUCN to the 43rd session of the World Heritage Committee (30 June - 10 July 2019)

State Party	World Heritage nomination	ID No.	Recommendation
<b>NATURAL PROPERTIES</b>			
Brazil	Cerrado Protected Areas: Chapada dos Veadeiros and Emas National Parks	1035 Bis	OK
Denmark	Ilulissat Icefjord	1149 Bis	OK
<b>CULTURAL PROPERTIES</b>			
Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	City of Potosí	420 Bis	R
Chile	Churches of Chiloé	971 Bis	OK/R
Chile	Humberstone and Santa Laura Saltpeter Works	1178 Ter	OK
France	Arles, Roman and Romanesque Monuments	164 Bis	R
Germany	Garden Kingdom of Dessau-Wörlitz	534 Bis	OK
Germany	Maulbronn Monastery Complex	546 Bis	OK
Honduras	Maya Site of Copan	129 Bis	R
Italy	Venice and its Lagoon	394 Bis	R
Norway	Bryggen	59 Bis	R
Portugal	University of Coimbra – Alta and Sofia	1387 Bis	OK
Sweden	Royal Domain of Drottningholm	559 Bis	OK

### KEY

R	Referral
OK	Approval Recommended
NA	Approval Not recommended

## A. NATURAL PROPERTIES

### A.1. EUROPE - NORTH AMERICA

Property	Ilulissat Icefjord
ID No.	1149 Bis
State Party	Denmark

See IUCN Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 13.

#### **Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.41**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B2.Add,
2. Recalling Decision **28 COM 14B.8** adopted at its 28th session (Suzhou, 2004),
3. Approves the proposed minor boundary modification for the **Ilulissat Icefjord, Denmark**;
4. Requests the State Party to provide further details to the World Heritage Centre by **1 February 2020**, for review by IUCN, to clarify the policies that will apply to the local and recreational buffer zones, in particular regarding the scope of development that is anticipated to be permitted;
5. Also requests the State Party to continue to assess any development, whether inside or outside the property and its buffer zone, that has the potential to impact on its Outstanding Universal Value in line with the IUCN World Heritage Advice Note on Environmental Impact Assessment.

### A.2. LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

Property	Cerrado Protected Areas: Chapada dos Veadeiros and Emas National Parks
ID No.	1035 Bis
State Party	Brazil

See IUCN Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 19.

#### **Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.42**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B2.Add,
2. Recalling Decisions **37 COM 7B.29**, **39 COM 7B.27**, **40 COM 7B.71** and **41 COM 7B.10** adopted at its 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and 41st (Krakow, 2017) sessions respectively,
3. Approves the proposed minor boundary modification for **Cerrado Protected Areas: Chapada dos Veadeiros and Emas National Parks, Brazil**, however, does not approve the excision of the area at the centre of the Chapada dos Veadeiros component of the property;

4. Takes note of the ongoing consideration of the State of Conservation of the property by the Committee, and recommends that the next report on the property include consideration of the effectiveness of the implementation of the protection and management requirements of the property in relation to its revised boundary.

## B. CULTURAL PROPERTIES

### B.1. EUROPE - NORTH AMERICA

Property	Arles, Roman and Romanesque Monuments
ID No.	164 Bis
State Party	France

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 46.

#### **Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.43**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the proposed buffer zone for **Arles, Roman and Romanesque Monuments, France**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
  - a) Provide a clear rationale regarding the delineation of the buffer zone, and the reason why some areas are included and others are not,
  - b) Provide specific documentation and details regarding building regulations, and how they prevent new buildings to disrupt the historical skyline of the World Heritage property,
  - c) Provide the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) undertaken for the Luma Arles tower, and its relation with the World Heritage property. In case of non-existence of an HIA, provide the recommendations that were presented by State Services, regarding the construction of the Luma Arles tower,
  - d) Deliver a Visual Impact Analysis of the Luma Arles tower on the property and its Outstanding Universal Value.

Property	Garden Kingdom of Dessau-Wörlitz
ID No.	534 Bis
State Party	Germany

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 38.

#### **Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.44**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,



2. Approves the proposed minor boundary modification for the **Garden Kingdom of Dessau-Wörlitz, Germany**;
3. Also approves the proposed buffer zone for the Palace Mosigkau component part of the **Garden Kingdom of Dessau-Wörlitz, Germany**.

Property	Maulbronn Monastery Complex
ID No.	546 Bis
State Party	Germany

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 40.

**Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.45**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Approves the proposed minor boundary modification for **Maulbronn Monastery Complex, Germany**;
3. Also approves the proposed buffer zones for **Maulbronn Monastery Complex, Germany**;
4. Requests the State Party to provide a clear table detailing each component part of the property, as well as the two buffer zones, as prescribed by the Operational Guidelines.

Property	Venice and its Lagoon
ID No.	394 Bis
State Party	Italy

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 48.

**Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.46**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the proposed buffer zone for **Venice and its Lagoon, Italy**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
  - a) Provide clarification why one of the water body has been excluded from the proposed buffer zone and reconsider the exclusion of this part of the southern coastal strip from the proposed buffer zone,
  - b) Sign a Programme Agreement in order to put in place officially the governance system for the coordinated management, enhancement and sustainable development of the proposed buffer zone.

Property	Bryggen
ID No.	59 Bis
State Party	Norway

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 51.

**Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.47**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the proposed buffer zone for **Bryggen, Norway**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
  - a) Extend the buffer zone to include a wider area in the northeast part of the property, as it could prevent urban pressure to directly impact the World Heritage property; or to provide a clear and solid rationale for the exclusion of this area,
  - b) Undertake an Heritage Impact Assessment regarding the future tram track that will pass in the buffer zone, to assess the potential impact on Bryggen's Outstanding Universal Value.

Property	University of Coimbra – Alta and Sofia
ID No.	1387 Bis
State Party	Portugal

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 42.

**Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.48**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Approves the proposed minor boundary modification for the **University of Coimbra – Alta and Sofia, Portugal**;
3. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
  - a) Drawing up a master plan for the Machado de Castro Museum,
  - b) Submitting the management plan, once finalised, to the World Heritage Centre.

Property	Royal Domain of Drottningholm
ID No.	559 Bis
State Party	Sweden

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 44.

**Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.49**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,

2. Approves the proposed buffer zone for the **Royal Domain of Drottingholm, Sweden**;
3. Recommends that the State Party develop a new integrated management plan for the World Heritage property and the buffer zone, including a Spatial Development Plan, covering the County Administrative Board and Ekerö municipality, as well as a comprehensive mobility plan.

## B.2. LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

Property	City of Potosí
ID No.	420 Bis
State Party	Bolivia (Plurinational State of)

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 58.

### Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.50

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the proposed buffer zone for the **City of Potosí, Plurinational State of Bolivia**, to the State Party in order to allow it to:
  - a) Elaborate a clear description of:
    - i) the limits of the buffer zone,
    - ii) the limits of the area of environmental influence,
  - b) Clarify the rationale for the delineation of these boundaries, by taking into account the protection of the visually sensitive areas around the property, as mentioned by the Decision **38 COM 7B.38**,
  - c) Provide explicit information on the legal and management aspects, such as land use regulations, that are applied in the regulation of the newly defined buffer zone and area of environmental influence,
  - d) Provide detailed explanations on the different regulations applicable in areas which are already in place and overlapping with the buffer zone (such as Intensive Protection Area of the Historical Center, the Historic Center Transition Area, the Protected Area of the Ribera de los Ingenios, and the Cerro Rico Protection Area), and also describe which regulations take precedence,
  - e) Consider the possibility to homogenize the limits of the different zones, in order to reduce overlap.

Property	Churches of Chiloé
ID No.	971 Bis
State Party	Chile

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 53.

### Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.51

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Approves the proposed minor modification to the boundaries of the buffer zones for the six components: Chelín, Colo, Detif, Ichuac, Nercón and Villipulli of the serial property **Churches of Chiloé, Chile**;
3. Refers the proposed minor modification to the boundaries of the buffer zones of the following components of the serial property **Churches of Chiloé, Chile**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
  - a) Chonchi: extend the proposed buffer zone to include the area behind the church, where the topography and vegetation are important as part of the church's setting,
  - b) Quinchao: extend the proposed buffer zone to include the area behind the church to include, within the boundaries of the protected zone, the topography and the existing vegetation,
  - c) San Juan: extend the proposed buffer zone to include a larger area of the surrounding landscape, with its topography and vegetation, as proposed in the Preliminary Protection Area,
  - d) Tenaún: extend the proposed buffer zone to include a larger part of the surrounding landscape, with its topography and vegetation;
4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
  - a) Completing the table showing clearly the exact extent of each component part of the property in hectares,
  - b) Finalizing the identification of buffer zones around the remaining churches of Castro and Caguach and conclude the process for the churches of Achao, Rilán, Aldachildo and Dalcahue,
  - c) Providing the Intervention Guidelines for all Typical Zones of the property,
  - d) Urgently establishing a Management Plan for the property, the proposed buffer zones and the wider setting.

Property	Humberstone and Santa Laura Saltpeter Works
ID No.	1178 Ter
State Party	Chile

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 56.

**Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.52**

*The World Heritage Committee,*

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Approves the proposed buffer zone for **Humberstone and Santa Laura Saltpeter Works, Chile.**

Property	Maya Site of Copan
ID No.	129 Bis
State Party	Honduras

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, 2019, page 60.

**Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.53**

*The World Heritage Committee,*

1. Having examined Documents WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add and WHC/19/43.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the proposed buffer zone for the **Maya Site of Copan, Honduras**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
  - a) Complete the map showing the proposed buffer zone with a comprehensive legend and the localisation of the area of influence and the eleven protective enclaves,
  - b) Provide more detailed information on the legislation regulating the property, the buffer zone and the area of influence,
  - c) Specify how the regulation of the buffer zone will be enforced and how and when an agreement with all the landowners will be reached.

### III. STATEMENTS OF OUTSTANDING UNIVERSAL VALUE OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED AT PREVIOUS SESSIONS AND NOT ADOPTED BY THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

**Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.54**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add,
2. Adopts the Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for the following World Heritage properties inscribed at previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee:
  - China, Fanjingshan;
  - Germany, Naumburg Cathedral;
  - Iran (Islamic Republic of), Sassanid Archaeological Landscape of Fars Region;
  - Iraq, The Ahwar of Southern Iraq: Refuge of Biodiversity and the Relict Landscape of the Mesopotamian Cities;
  - Italy, Ivrea, industrial city of the 20th century;
  - Mexico, Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica;
  - Oman, Ancient City of Qalhat;
  - Republic of Korea, Sansa, Buddhist Mountain Monasteries in Korea;
  - Turkey, Aphrodisias;
  - Turkey, Göbekli Tepe.

Property	Fanjingshan
State Party	China
ID No.	1559
Date of inscription	2018

**Brief synthesis**

The Fanjingshan World Heritage property is located in South-West China, covering a total area of 40,275 ha, fully enclosed by a buffer zone of 37,239 ha. Fanjingshan is located in a monsoonal climatic context and is an important source of water for the surrounding landscapes and beyond, with some 20 rivers and streams feeding the Wujiang and Yuanjiang River systems, both of which ultimately drain into the Yangtze River.

The property consists of two parts, namely the Jian Nan subtropical evergreen forests ecoregion (64%) and the Guizhou Plateau broadleaf and mixed forests ecoregion (36%). The highest peak, Mt Fenghuangshan, has an elevation of 2,570 m above sea level (masl) and the property covers an altitudinal range of more than 2,000 m. The resulting vertical stratification of vegetation falls within three

major altitudinal vegetation zones: evergreen broadleaf forest (<1,300 masl), mixed evergreen and deciduous broadleaf forest (1,300-2,200 masl) and mixed deciduous broadleaf and conifer and scrub forest (>2,200 masl).

Fanjingshan is an island of metamorphic rock in a sea of karst and is home to many ancient and relict plant and animal species which originated in the Tertiary period, between 65 million and 2 million years ago. The property's geologic and climatic characteristics have shaped its flora which behaves as if it were on an island. This has led to a high degree of endemism, with a total of 46 locally endemic plant species, 4 endemic vertebrate species and 245 endemic invertebrate species. The most prominent endemic species are Fanjingshan Fir (*Abies fanjingshanensis* - EN) and Guizhou Snub-nosed Monkey (*Rhinopithecus brelichi* - EN), both of which are entirely restricted to the property. Three species of *Fagus* (*F. longipetiolata*, *F. lucida*, and *F. engleriana*) are the dominant species of what is understood to be the largest primary beech forest in the subtropical region.

A total of 3,724 plant species have been recorded in the property, an impressive 13% of China's total flora. The property is characterized by an exceptionally high richness in bryophytes as well as one of the distribution centres for gymnosperms in China. The diversity of invertebrates is also very high with 2,317 species. A total of 450 vertebrate species are found inside the property. Fanjingshan being the only habitat in the world for Fanjingshan Fir and Guizhou Snub-nosed Monkey, as well as 64 plant and 38 animal species that are listed as globally threatened, including the tree *Bretschneidera sinensis* (EN), Chinese Giant Salamander (*Andrias davidianus* - CR), Forest Musk Deer (*Moschus berezovskii* - EN), Reeves's Pheasant (*Syrnaticus reevesii* - VU), and Asiatic Black Bear (*Ursus thibetanus* - VU).

**Criterion (x):** Fanjingshan is characterized by an exceptional richness in bryophytes, with 791 species, of which 74 are endemic to China. The property also has one of the richest concentrations of gymnosperms in the world, with 36 species. A significant number of endemic species are distributed inside the property, including 46 local endemic and 1,010 Chinese endemic plant species, as well as 4 locally endemic vertebrate species. The most notable of these is the endangered Guizhou Snub-nosed Monkey, which is found only in Fanjingshan and nowhere else in the world. Another prominent endemic species is Fanjingshan Fir, which is also restricted to this property.

The property contains 64 plant and 38 animal species that are listed as Vulnerable (VU), Endangered (EN) or Critically Endangered (CR) on the IUCN Red List, most notably Guizhou Snub-nosed Monkey, Chinese Giant Salamander, Forest Musk Deer, Reeves's Pheasant, Asiatic Black Bear, and *Bretschneidera sinensis*.

**Integrity**

The property comprises three contiguous areas: Fanjingshan National Nature Reserve, Yinjiang Yangxi Provincial Nature Reserve, and a small area of National Non-Commercial Forest. The property behaves like a biogeographic island and is relatively small, however at the time of inscription, it is of adequate size to ensure the complete representation of the key habitats and viable populations which convey the property's significance. The boundaries of the property and its buffer zone are clearly designated. The property covers all important local floristic elements, and is of sufficient size to encompass the entire known home range of Guizhou Snub-nosed Monkey. Maintaining good ecological connectivity between the different types of protected areas which make up the property will be crucial to the viability of isolated and very restricted range populations of threatened species.

Fanjingshan National Nature Reserve is also a UNESCO Biosphere Reserve. It will be important to rationalise, where feasible, the zones of the Biosphere Reserve to correspond with the boundaries of the property and its buffer zone in order to streamline protection and management.

**Protection and management requirements**

All land in the property is owned and regulated by the State Party. The property is protected by a comprehensive range of national and provincial legislation applicable to the national and provincial nature reserves, as well as the small area of National Non-Commercial Forest which make up the property. Furthermore, much of the buffer zone and the wider landscape enjoy various levels of legal protection, as they are part of provincial parks. In addition, the villages within the property and its buffer zone each have their own village regulations, which prescribe certain behaviours that respect the natural environment of the mountain.

There are three main management agencies responsible for the property, i.e. the Administration of Fanjingshan National Nature Reserve, the Administration of Yinjiang Yangxi Provincial Nature Reserve, and the Forest Department. In March 2018, the Ministry of Natural Resources was formally established in China. All the protected areas in China are now implemented under a single unified management system by the National Forestry and Grassland Administration under the Ministry. In August 2017, the Institutional Committee of the People's Government of

Guizhou Province approved the establishment of Protection and Management Bureau of Fanjingshan Natural Heritage, to ensure unified management across the property and its buffer zone.

Other relevant plans exist for the management of each of the constituent protected areas (except for the National Non-commercial Forest), for ecotourism development of Guizhou Fanjingshan National Nature Reserve, and for the conservation of Guizhou Snub-nosed Monkey. To a certain extent, these plans also address threats outside the boundaries of the property, where the component protected areas extend beyond these boundaries.

Current staffing levels, although relatively small, are considered adequate at the time of inscription, in part due to the collaboration with local police and the small portion of the property which is open to the public. A system is being implemented to monitor visitors, environmental quality, natural disasters, human activity, and villages. The property is relatively small with highly endangered and vulnerable species populations and it will be important that growing tourism demand is carefully managed to avoid negative impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value.

There are several villages within the property and in the buffer zone and a voluntary relocation and compensation programme is in effect to reduce the permanent population within the property. It will be critical to ensure that any relocation is fully voluntary and in line with the policies of the World Heritage Convention and relevant international norms, including principles related to free, prior and informed consent, effective consultation, fair compensation, access to social benefits and skills training, and the preservation of cultural rights.

Property	Naumburg Cathedral
State Party	Germany
ID No.	1470 Rev
Date of inscription	2018

**Brief Synthesis**

Naumburg Cathedral, located in the south of the State of Saxony-Anhalt, is a unique testimony to medieval art and architecture. Most of the church building dates back to the 13th century. It is composed of a basilical Romanesque nave flanked by two Gothic choirs in the east and in the west. The west choir with the famous portrait statues of the twelve cathedral founders and the west rood screen are the masterpieces of pan-European workshop accordingly named the "Naumburg Master", who conceptualized all parts of the western choir as a whole, and carried out the western choir from the bottom to the roof within six years only. The polychrome reliefs and sculptures of the choir and the rood

screen count among the most significant sculptures of the Middle Ages. The overall iconographic concept and the harmonious combination of architecture, sculpture and glass paintings reflect in a unique way the profound changes in the religious practice and the visual arts of the 13th century. These changes resulted in a hitherto unknown realism and observation of nature, as well as in the recourse to ancient sources.

**Criterion (i):** The episcopal church of Naumburg is unique among the medieval cathedrals due to the west choir conceptualized and designed by a brilliant sculptor – the “Naumburg Master” – and his workshop. The organic combination of architecture, sculpture and glass paintings created an extraordinary synthesis of the arts. The twelve life-sized, colored founder figures in the west choir, the passion reliefs of the west rood screen, the crucifixion group on its portal and the numerous capitals are outstanding examples of the architectural sculpture of the Middle Ages. One of the founder figures – Uta of Ballenstedt – is considered as one of the icons of Gothic sculpture. They are sculpted from the same blocks of stone as the pillar strips, and the various media are integrated in the fabric of the architecture and its manner of construction. A single intelligence stood behind the integrated conception of the architecture, sculpture, and stained glass and merged them into one integral piece of work.

**Criterion (ii):** The workshop organization of sculptors and stonemasons was established in the early 13th century and is known under the name Naumburg Master. It constitutes one of the decisive conveyors and pioneers of the ground-breaking innovations in architecture and sculpture in the second half of the 13th century. The migration of the workshop of the Naumburg Master, from northeastern France through the Middle Rhine areas to the eastern boundaries of the Holy Roman Empire and further to southwestern Europe, gives testimony to the extensive European cultural exchange during the High Middle Ages.

#### **Integrity**

The inscribed property contains all the attributes necessary to convey its Outstanding Universal Value, primarily, the Cathedral and associated architectural elements, sculptures and artworks, all retained in their original layout. The structural elements of the 13th century are intact and do not suffer from adverse effects of development or neglect. The visual qualities and functional relations to the surrounding urban and cultural landscape are undisturbed. The buffer zone reflects the urban morphology of the old town of Naumburg.

#### **Authenticity**

The authenticity of Naumburg Cathedral is demonstrated by the intact materials and form of the Cathedral and associated buildings,

artworks and sculptures, which date to the High Middle Ages. All repairs have utilized stone from the original quarries used to build the Cathedral, and restoration works have occurred since the 19<sup>th</sup> century. The building has maintained its original functions, and services are conducted regularly. The location and setting of the cathedral within the centre of the old town of Naumburg is unchanged, and overall, the property demonstrates a good state of conservation.

#### **Protection and management requirements**

Naumburg Cathedral is protected by the Act for the Protection of Historic Monuments and Buildings of the State of Saxony-Anhalt (DenkmSchG LSA), which is the highest possible level of legal protection available. The Federal Building Code and Regional Planning Act support the protection of the property through the regulation of new development. All cultural monuments and sites within the buffer zone are listed in the register of monuments by the Federal State of Saxony-Anhalt. Building activities in the buffer zone are subject to land development plans, building development plans and municipal statutes. The town development plans of the city of Naumburg are basic instruments for sustainable tourism.

The cathedral and adjacent buildings are owned by the Combined Cathedral Chapters (Combined Chapters of the Cathedrals of Merseburg and Naumburg and the Collegiate Church of Zeitz). This public foundation is responsible for the protection and conservation of the cultural monuments entrusted to its care. The conservation and maintenance works on the building and the general management of the property are carried out by the owner in close cooperation with the State Ministry of Culture of Saxony-Anhalt and the City of Naumburg.

There are few pressures identified that impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of Naumburg Cathedral, although a range of factors require ongoing management, such as traffic issues and air pollution. Current and expected visitation to the property is well-managed and within the estimated carrying capacity, which is regularly reviewed.

There is no Management Plan for the inscribed property, a Management Plan was prepared in 2014 for a larger cultural landscape in which the cathedral is located and provides some general orientations. An adequate system for monitoring the state of conservation is in place.

The Saale-Unstrut World Heritage Association was founded in 2008 to guide the processes of World Heritage nomination and provides an avenue of participation for community interests, including both private and public stakeholders.

An international visitor centre is planned within the inscribed property, although the specific proposal is yet to be forwarded to the World

Heritage Centre for review in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines.

Property	Sassanid Archaeological Landscape of Fars Region
State Party	Iran (Islamic Republic of)
ID No.	1568
Date of inscription	2018

### **Brief Synthesis**

The serial property Sassanid Archaeological Landscape of the Fars Region is composed of 8 selected archaeological site components in three geographical area contexts at Firuzabad, Bishapur and Sarvestan, all located in the Fars Province of southern Iran. The components include fortification structures, palaces, reliefs and city remains dating back to the earliest and latest moments of the Sassanid Empire, which stretched across the region from 224 to 651 CE. Among the sites are the dynasty founder Ardashir Papakan's military headquarters and first capital, and a city and architectural structures of his successor, the ruler Shapur I. In Sarvestan, a monument dating into the Early Islamic period illustrates the transition from the Sassanid to the Islamic era.

The ancient cities of Ardashir Khurreh and Bishapur include the most significant remaining testimonies of the earliest moments of the Sassanid Empire, the commencement under Ardashir I and the establishment of power under both Ardashir I and his successor Shapur I. In locations strategically selected for defence purposes, the cities were planned in their surrounding environments and illustrate urban typologies, such as the circular shape of Ardashir Khurreh, which became influential to later Sassanid and Islamic cities. The surrounding landscape was imprinted with Sassanid testimonies, such as the reliefs and sculptures cut into the rock cliffs and the defensive structures protecting the cities. The architecture of the Sassanid monuments in the property further illustrates early examples of construction of domes with squinches on square spaces, such as in the chahar-taq buildings, where the four sides of the square room show arched openings: this architectural form turned into the most typical form of Sassanid religious architecture, relating closely to the expansion and stabilization of Zoroastrianism under Sassanid reign and continuing during the Islamic era thanks to its usage in religious and holy buildings such as mosques and tombs.

**Criterion (ii):** The Sassanid Archaeological Landscape of the Fars region was influenced by the Achaemenid and Parthian cultural and ritual traditions, and references their architectural and artistic approaches. This is illustrated in the rock-carving techniques of the reliefs in the Firuzabad and Bishapur components and the sculpture of Shapur I in Tang-e Chogan.

Likewise, particularly in Bishapur, the property illustrates influences deriving from the encounter with Roman art and architecture, contemporaneous with it. The Sassanid urban plan of Ardashir Khurreh inspired city planning throughout the region well into the Islamic era and Sarvestan Monument demonstrates how Sassanid architectural language continued to be utilized in Early Islamic times.

**Criterion (iii):** The property bears an exceptional testimony to the Early Sassanid Civilization and its contribution to the distribution and establishment of Zoroastrianism. As for the architectural language, the chahar-taq form illustrates best the linkages of Zoroastrianism and Sassanid rule: the Sassanid Archaeological Landscape of Fars Region encompasses Zoroastrian monumental architecture from its very beginning with the Takht-e Neshin, its consolidation at Bishapur, here in particular with the fire temple formerly interpreted as Shapur's Palace and its development during the Early Islamic time with the Sarvestan Monument. The layout and location of the two first Sassanid ruling cities are testimonies to the legitimization and hierarchy of power as well as ritual ceremonies.

**Criterion (v):** The Sassanid archaeological landscape represents a highly efficient system of land use and strategic utilization of natural topography in the creation of the earliest cultural centres of the Sassanid civilization. Using indigenous construction materials and based on optimal exploitation of the surrounding natural resources including mountains, plains and rivers, a diverse set of urban structures, castles, buildings, bas-reliefs and other relevant monuments took shape within the landscape. Overall the Sassanid Archaeological Landscape of Fars Region is an outstanding example of the traditional land-use of Fars region where water management plays a fundamental role, and in which the Sassanid foundation of inhabited settlements and monumental buildings integrates itself in the landscape.

### **Integrity**

The monuments of the Sassanid Archaeological Landscape of Fars Region, Islamic Republic of Iran, retain a high degree of integrity in visual and spatial terms. The property does not suffer from effects of development, except for a settlement expansion east of Ardashir Palace and a road construction at Bishapur. Both are controlled to prevent further expansion or similar developments.

The Sassanid archaeological sites, monuments and buildings are far from urban spaces and are strategically integrated into their surrounding topography, including straits, rivers, gorges and plains around them. Some of these landscape features, which carry attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value, are not yet included within the property boundaries and a boundary adjustment is foreseen to integrate

separate serial components within the surrounding landscape.

#### **Authenticity**

The property is largely intact and most interventions which could have impacted the urban plans or would have changed historical construction materials or caused negative transformation in the setting and natural environment surrounding the monuments were avoided in accordance with the existing legal regulations.

Qal'e-ye Dokhtar, Ardashir Palace and Sarvestan, despite having been affected by past earthquakes and being subject to visible deterioration processes, can be considered authentic in form and design. Participation of traditional master workers familiar with the usage of traditional methods and construction materials has contributed to the preservation of authenticity. However, some of the restorations done on the structures at these sites, namely where wall facings have been applied to avoid crumbling of the core masonry, also include a large percentage of new materials, including plaster and black cement, with new stones used for the facing of the walls. The vault of the main ivan of Ardashir Palace in Firuzabad has been partly reconstructed for static reasons using concrete and stone facings.

The rock reliefs of Ardashir and those of Tang-e Chogan retain a largely authentic condition. Despite the transformation of the land due to agricultural activities, Ardashir Khurreh still preserves its authentic form and design. Nevertheless, this is rather vulnerable as it could change very quickly with adjunctions of parcels of land as a result of inheritance or other division which would affect the shape of the plots and could eventually remove part of the original design of the city. In general, the settings of most of the components still preserve their authentic aspects as they were during the Sassanid period.

#### **Protection and management requirements**

The individual property components are as monuments and archaeological sites at the national level, such as Qal'e-ye Dokhtar, number 269 in 1315 A.H (1936 CE), Ardashir Palace, number 89 in 1310 A.H (1931 CE), Ardashir Khurreh, number 17 in 1310 A.H (1931 CE), Sassanid Atashkadeh (fire temple) of Ardashir Khurreh, number 289 in 1316 A.H, (1937 CE), the historic city of Bishapur, number 24 in 1310 A.H (1931 CE), and Sarvestan monument, number 23 in 1310 A.H (1931 CE).

Within the context of these designations, the State Party developed specific regulations, not only for the property areas but also for the buffer zones and, where existing, landscape zones. These are largely relevant. Merely at Ardashir Khurreh, the permissibility of agricultural use should be carefully considered and preceded by archaeological and geophysical surveys

confirming the absence of underground archaeological remains.

The Iranian Cultural Heritage, Handicrafts and Tourism Organization (ICHHTO) is responsible for the conservation and management of the property. The state of conservation of Sassanid Archaeological Landscape of the Fars region is at times critical and planning and implementation of adequate conservation measures needs to be given highest priority. The anticipated coordinated approach to conservation envisaged by the State Party needs to be laid out in a conservation plan and implemented consistently to ensure the long-term preservation of the property.

The property is administered by a structure established for the purpose of its management, which is referred to as SALF Base (Sassanid Archaeological Landscape in the Fars Region Base). The Base reports to both the Deputy Director of Tourism and the Deputy Director for Cultural Heritage Conservation in ICHHTO but is coordinated primarily through the Cultural Heritage Conservation department. The Base is advised and guided by a Steering and a Technical Committee. The integrated management and conservation plan for the property, which shall integrate dedicated sections of risk preparedness, disaster response and a monitoring system, will be finalized.

Property	The Ahwar of Southern Iraq: Refuge of Biodiversity and the Relict Landscape of the Mesopotamian Cities
State Party	Iraq
ID No.	1481
Date of inscription	2016

#### **Brief Synthesis**

The Ahwar of Southern Iraq evolved as part of the wider alluvial plain during the final stage of the alpine tectonic movement, which also led to the creation of the Zagros Mountains. Several factors intertwined to shape the property including; tectonic movements, climatic changes, river hydrology dynamics, precipitation variation, and changes in sea level. The sea level variation and the climatic changes had a significant role in influencing the quantity and quality of water entering the Ahwar through rivers and their branches, in addition to advancement and regression of the sea and intrusion during dry to semi-dry to wet conditions during the last 18,000 years.

Between 5000 and 3000 BC, sea water level reached its maximum extent some 200 km inland of the present coastline with marshes stretching further inland. The marshy and moving landscape of this deltaic plain was the heartland where the first cities flourished. Uruk, Ur and Eridu, the three cultural components of



the property, were originally situated on the margins of freshwater marshes and developed into some of the most important urban centres of southern Mesopotamia. These cities saw the origin of writing, monumental architecture in the form of mudbrick temples and ziggurats, and complex technologies and societies. A vast corpus of cuneiform texts and archaeological evidence testifies to the centrality of the marshes for the economy, worldview and religious beliefs of successive cultures in southern Mesopotamia.

Starting in 2000 BC, the sea regressed towards the south. This led to another climatic change towards a more arid environment leading to the drying up of the ancient marshes and in turn to the decline of the great cities of southern Mesopotamia. Today the mudbrick ruins of Uruk, Ur and Eridu are dominated by the remains of ziggurats which still stand within the arid but striking landscape of the desiccated alluvial plain.

With the regression of the sea water, new marshes formed to the southeast. The main marshes of the Ahwar as we know them today were formed during this period around 3,000 years ago.

The Huwaizah, East and West Hammar and Central Marshes of the Ahwar are predominantly fed by the Tigris and Euphrates Rivers.

The Huwaizah Marshes component is a unique freshwater system, receiving high water quantities from floods and limited amounts of seasonal rain which descends from the northern and north-eastern heights. Concurrently, it is the sole natural component that was not drastically drained in the 1980s and 1990s, leading to the salvation of its key ecological elements. This led it to become the primary refuge for many of the key bird species of African and Indian origin in the Middle East, which have since spread back to other components after the reflooding took place in early 2000s.

The Central Marshes component comprises today's ecological core of the Ahwar. Being distinctive for its extensive ecosystems, it provides a vast habitat for many of the viable populations of taxa of high biodiversity and conservation importance.

The East and West Hammar Marshes components embrace a particular ecological phenomenon in contrast to the other components. Here, the salt water from the sea progresses inland affected on one side by tidal movements in the southern-most regions of marshes, while on the other side, pushing its way into the extended desert to the southeast. This creates very specific ecological conditions with marine fish species utilizing the area for reproduction in the East Hammar, while the West Hammar comprises the last stopover area for millions of migrating birds before entering the vast Arabian Desert.

**Criterion (iii):** The remains of the Mesopotamian cities of Uruk, Ur and Eridu offer an outstanding testimony to the growth and subsequent decline of southern Mesopotamian urban centres and societies from the Ubaid and Sumerian periods until the Babylonian and Hellenistic periods. The three cities were major religious, political, economic and cultural centres which emerged and grew during a period of profound change in human history. These three components of the property bear witness to the contribution of southern Mesopotamian cultures to the development of ancient Near Eastern urbanized societies and the history of mankind as a whole: the construction of monumental public works and structures in the form of ziggurats, temples, palaces, city walls, and hydraulic works; a class structured society reflected in the urban layout which included royal tombs and palaces, sacred precincts, public storehouses, areas dedicated to industries, and extensive residential neighbourhoods; the centralized control of resources and surplus which gave rise to the first writing system and administrative archives; and conspicuous consumption of imported goods. This exceptionally creative period in human history left its marks across place and time.

**Criterion (v):** The remains of the ancient cities of Uruk, Ur and Eridu, today in the desert but originally situated near freshwater marshes which receded or became saline before drying up, best exemplify the impact of the unstable deltaic landscape of the Tigris and Euphrates upon the rise and fall of large urban centres. Testimonies of this relict wetland landscape are found today in the cities' topography as traces of shallow depressions which held permanent or seasonal marshes, dry waterways and canal beds, and settlement mounds formed upon what were once islets surrounded by marsh water. Architectural elements, archaeological evidence and an important corpus of cuneiform texts further document how the landscape of wetlands contributed to shaping the religious beliefs, cultic practices, and literary and artistic expressions of successive cultures in southern Mesopotamia.

**Criterion (ix):** The Huwaizah, East and West Hammar and Central Marshes demonstrate internationally significant ecological succession processes in one of the most arid inland deltas in the world, and contain a high degree of speciation in a relatively young ecosystem. It is one of the largest West Eurasian-Caspian-Nile staging points and wintering grounds for ducks as well as a major stopover point for shorebirds flying along the West Asian-East African flyway. It is also significant for the migration of fish and shrimp species from the Persian Gulf to the marshlands, with most of the fish species demonstrating diadromous characteristics (migratory between salt and fresh waters).

**Criterion (x):** *The Huwaizah, East and West Hammar and Central Marshes contain highly important and significant habitats for in-situ conservation of biological diversity, including endemic, and restricted range species, and numerous populations of threatened species.*

*This includes bird species (e.g. the endemic Basra Reed Warbler and Iraq Babbler, restricted range subspecies of the Little Grebe, Black Francolin and Hooded Crow and the vulnerable Marbled Teal), mammals (e.g. the endemic Bunn's Short-tailed Bandicoot Rat, a subspecies of the Smooth-coated Otter, and the range-restricted Mesopotamian Gerbil and Euphrates Jerboa), as well as 6 range-restricted fish species. The property provides habitat for several reptiles including the Euphrates Soft-shell Turtle, an endangered species that is only known from a few localities in Iraq and Iran, and Murray's Comb-fingered Gecko which has a restricted range limited to the Ahwar, Shatt Al Arab and the Iranian western shores. The marshes also provide habitat for relict populations of three bird species (the African Darter, the Sacred Ibis, and the Goliath Heron) that are thousands of kilometres away from their core global populations in Africa.*

#### **Integrity**

*The three archaeological ensembles included in the property offer a comprehensive picture of the Ubaid and Sumerian urbanization process within their original but now dried marshland setting. Almost all the major archaeological and architectural features of Eridu, Uruk, and Ur are contained within the boundaries of the property but some are in the buffer zone and beyond. In Ur, the main harbour, situated outside the boundaries of the property, has yet to be excavated and the boundaries of the property might be extended at a later stage to include it.*

*The use of mud as the main building material in southern Mesopotamia creates specific conservation conditions. The toll which the passing of time took on the abandoned southern Mesopotamian cities is heavier than in the case of stone or fired brick architecture found in other regions of the ancient world where remains can be monumental and visually impressive. Yet the remains of the four ziggurats of Eridu, Uruk and Ur, however eroded, still tower over the desert landscape and provide a striking visual testimony of the antiquity and durability of the most emblematic architectural features of Mesopotamian cities.*

*Layers of sedimentation protected the remains of Uruk, Ur and Eridu until the 20th century when archaeological excavations exposed several buildings anew. Eridu's excavated remains were later reburied except for the ziggurat. In Uruk and Ur there were some instances of incompatible material used to consolidate or protect the remains, whereas others were left exposed with no maintenance or protection between the 1930s and 1960s with the result that some have become affected by*

*erosion caused mainly by rain and dust storms. Only Ur has suffered limited, but reversible, damages during the recent conflict.*

*Overall the integrity of the three cities is vulnerable: the conservation of their exposed fabric needs urgent attention to halt further irreversible erosion and collapse.*

*The four wetland components of the property cover an area of over 210,000 ha an additional 200,000 ha of buffer zones surrounding each of the four components provide further protection of the property on a whole as well as at the component level. Considering that these components are ecologically interdependent, there is a need to establish a set of ecological corridors to ensure connectivity of the serial property.*

*The most notable threat to the property's ecological integrity pertains to water flows fluctuating significantly with the continued adequacy of flows in the future uncertain. There is a need to ensure that the minimum water flow is guaranteed for the property to sustain its biodiversity and ecological processes. More broadly, there is a need to conduct further studies to confirm the plant, vertebrate and invertebrate diversity within the property and its surrounding landscapes.*

*The four components embrace the majority of the breeding grounds of key bird species within different regions of the property. The breeding grounds are areas of low human intervention where reed vegetation is used to build nests on the banks of the small islets abundant in the area which are surrounded with extensive water bodies located in isolation from the dry lands and away from potential predators.*

*Numerous populations of more than 197 species of migrating water birds associated with the Palearctic region settle on the property and spend winter periods here during their west Eurasia-Caspian-Nile and Eurasian-Africa route migrations. The numbers of migrating birds utilizing the property is increasing, paralleling the improving levels of rehabilitation. Further, increasing numbers of globally threatened species are being documented.*

#### **Authenticity**

*In terms of material authenticity of the three urban archaeological sites, excavations of a series of emblematic public buildings allow for a good understanding of the spatial organization of the political, administrative and religious sections of the cities. Although there is no doubt of the link between the fabric and what they convey, that link is extremely vulnerable for some areas, where past lack of conservation and maintenance has caused irreversible erosion of the mud and burnt brick fabric and the potential collapse of some structures. The stage could soon be reached where vital evidence has been eroded.*

No major restoration or conservation projects have been carried out since the 1930s with the exception of the 1960s rebuilding of part of the outer shell of the Ur ziggurat using baked brick and limited amounts of cement. This intervention did not affect the original structure and shape of the monument but cracks in the cement are leading to water ingress. More recent conservation of the site has been done using compatible material as much as possible.

Overall the authenticity of the three cities is highly vulnerable due to a legacy of poor protection, maintenance and conservation.

#### **Protection and management requirements**

The overarching governance of the property is ensured by the National Committee for managing the Ahwar of Southern Iraq as a World Heritage Property. The committee is led by the Minister of Water Resources and includes the Ministry of Culture (State Board of Antiquities and Heritage), the Ministry of Health (Department of Environment), the Ministry of Oil, the Ministry of Agriculture, and other concerned ministries. The committee coordinates all governmental decisions of relevance to the property, including budgetary allocation and implementation steps of the 2015 Consolidated Management Plan developed for the property.

Uruk, Ur and Eridu are protected by the Antiquities and Heritage Law no. 55 of 2002 which takes precedence over any other public law, and each are registered in the Official Gazette as separate archaeological sites with their own boundaries and buffer zones corresponding to those of the component sites of the property.

The Iraqi State Board of Antiquities and Heritage (SBAH) has been working in partnership with foreign archaeological missions to start implementing the provisions of the management plan concerning specifically the three archaeological ensembles. Priorities include staff training and capacity-building together with surveys and conservation of the most unstable monuments and areas in each archaeological site. Furthermore, a monitoring system has been put in place to cover the three component sites and their buffer zones covering all factors that may affect their integrity and authenticity. Two dedicated management teams have been set up: one overseeing work at Uruk, the other in charge of Ur and Eridu. These teams report to the provincial Directorates of Antiquities and Heritage (DAH): The Dhi Qar DAH has jurisdiction over Ur and Eridu, whereas the Muthanna DAH has jurisdiction over Uruk. DAHs are assisted by the Antiquity and Heritage Police, created in 2007 for monitoring archaeological sites. The Antiquity and Heritage Police maintains a permanent presence at Uruk and Ur and regularly patrol at Eridu.

In order to address the highly unstable conservation conditions of the three cities, a programme of surveys will be undertaken to create a base-line delineation of the state of conservation of the property; a conservation programmes will be developed for all three cities on the basis of the surveys that clearly set out the various options for intervention in advance of conservation work commencing; and a detailed master plan/road map will be produced that ensures the conservation of the property on a sustainable basis.

The Huwaizah, East and West Hammar and Central Marshes have all been designated as Ramsar sites and their protection falls under the responsibility of the Ministry of Water Resources. Each marshland component has been allocated dedicated management staff who report to project management of Water Resources in the provinces of Dhi Qar, Maysan and Basra. In this case too, the provisions of the 2015 Consolidated Management Plan give priority to staff training and capacity-building in all areas relevant for the conservation of the property's natural value. The management plan also addresses the involvement of local stakeholders in the decision-making process, and the ability of local communities to improve their living conditions and preserve their traditional way of life. Furthermore, The Ministry of Water Resources (MWR) has just completed its "Strategy for Water and Land Resources in Iraq (SWRLI)" which covers the period until the year 2035. This strategy outlines the path towards integrated land and water management in light of the prevailing physical, hydrological and climatic conditions. It also examined the water-food-energy nexus in Iraq and recommended major investment plans in response to the adaptation measures to climate change and other development requirements.

SWRLI recognizes the Iraqi marshlands as a legitimate "water user" on an equal footing with agriculture, domestic and industrial uses. This is a major step forward in the strategy catering for the minimum water requirement for the environment.

Current annual and seasonal operational plans of the Iraqi water system managed by MWR seek to incorporate the minimum water flows allocated to the southern Iraqi marshlands, including the four marsh components of the property. An amount of 5.8 BCM (billion cubic meters) of water is allocated on a yearly basis for the marshland and is being incorporated in the operations of the water system. However, water flows are known to fluctuate significantly on an annual basis and therefore it is crucial that minimum water flow is generated and sustained in the long term.

A complex modelling exercise has been carried out by the Center for Restoration of Iraqi Marshes and Wetlands (CRIMW) to simulate the hydrology of southern Iraq. The simulations are aimed at determining the minimum monthly

water flows required for the four marsh components of the property to sustain the biodiversity and ecological processes. Major sustained efforts are however needed to better understand the hydrological regimes including defining minimum water requirements for the preservation of the natural value.

Regional issues such as dam projects, intensification of irrigation, pollution and drought in a changing climate remain challenges that have to be systematically considered as they will increase the pressure on these fragile wetlands. In addition, clarification and regulation measures need to be put in place in buffer zones where potential oil extraction activities could constitute an important threat to the integrity of the Ahwar. Finally, the impact of agricultural, fishing and hunting activities on ecosystems has to be adequately regulated. Tourism does not constitute a current threat but could have a larger influence in the medium term.

The boundaries of the four natural components and associated buffer zones provide protection against threats, such as oil exploration and urban development. However, enhanced efforts are needed to review boundaries and ensure that all components remain hydrologically and wherever possible ecologically connected.

Staffing remains inadequate for the property hence the recruitment and management of increased human resources, in particular the site manager, site rangers and site guides, is paramount. Management of the property requires strengthening in a way that considers traditional use and the dependency of communities on the natural components of the property.

Property	Ivrea, industrial city of the 20th century
State Party	Italy
ID No.	1538
Date of inscription	2018

**Brief synthesis**

Founded in 1908 by Camillo Olivetti, the Industrial City of Ivrea is an industrial and socio-cultural project of the 20th century. The Olivetti Company manufactured typewriters, mechanical calculators and desktop computers. Ivrea represents a model of the modern industrial city and a response to the challenges posed by rapid industrial change. It is therefore able to exhibit a response and a contribution to 20th century theories of urbanism and industrialisation. Ivrea's urban form and buildings were designed by some of the best-known Italian architects and town-planners of the period from the 1930s to the 1960s, under the direction of Adriano Olivetti. The city is comprised of buildings for manufacturing,

administration, social services and residential uses, reflecting the ideas of the Movimento Comunità (Community Movement) which was founded in Ivrea in 1947 based on Adriano Olivetti's 1945 book *L'Ordine politico delle Comunità* (The Political Order of Communities). The industrial city of Ivrea therefore represents a significant example of 20th century theories of urban development and architecture in response to industrial and social transformations, including the transition from mechanical to digital industries.

**Criterion (iv):** The industrial city of Ivrea is an ensemble of outstanding architectural quality that represents the work of Italian modernist designers and architects and demonstrates an exceptional example of 20th century developments in the design of production, taking into account changing industrial and social needs. Ivrea represents one of the first and highest expressions of a modern vision in relation to production, architectural design and social aspects at a global scale in relation to the history of industrial construction, and the transition from mechanical to digitalised industrial technologies.

The attributes of the property are: the spatial plan of the industrial city, the public buildings and spaces, and residential buildings developed by Olivetti (including their extant interior elements). The influences of the Community Movement on the provision of buildings for residential and social purposes is an important intangible element, although the functions of most non-residential buildings have ceased.

**Integrity**

The integrity of this urban area is based on the inclusion of the buildings, spaces and urban form required to convey the significance of Ivrea's 20th century development. The state of conservation of the city's components is variable. Many of the residential buildings exhibit a good/adequate state of conservation. However, the integrity of the property is considered to be vulnerable due to many factors and pressures including the encroachment of new urban developments, the deteriorating condition of some key industrial buildings and building interiors, the existence of some visually intrusive new constructions inside the property boundary and its buffer zone, and loss of the original activities and purposes due to the decline in manufacturing. The high number of vacant buildings and the need to find new uses also contribute to Ivrea's vulnerable integrity.

**Authenticity**

The authenticity of Ivrea is based on the high number and quality of urban and architectural projects that date to the primary period of Ivrea's development as an industrial city. A detailed analysis of the individual components in terms of their form, design and materials, and their location and immediate environment has been undertaken, and many elements have

*maintained their original characteristics in spite of the changes to production that affected the city during the last two decades. While many residential, administrative and services buildings are intact, others have been renovated; and a large number of the buildings are currently vacant, with an uncertain future. There is a risk of gradual loss of the authenticity of the property due to large-scale refurbishment proposals, decay of the exterior finishing of the facades and deterioration of the interior decoration and detailing. Efforts have been made to develop new uses that are similar in type to their original uses (such as telecommunications, production or cultural activities).*

**Protection and management requirements**

*Ivrea is protected according to legislative regimes at the national, regional and local levels. These include the national Cultural Heritage and Landscape Code (revised in 2004); the Regional Landscape and Cultural Heritage Code and the Regional Landscape Plan (2015); and the Ivrea Land Use Plan (2006). National protection for Ivrea is in place only for some buildings, and is still to be completed. The system of legal protection is complex and multi-tiered, with a heavy reliance on the commitment, resources and expertise of both national and municipal authorities. Improved streamlining and coordination between the local, regional and national institutions is needed. The protection of the visual integrity of the property and its buffer zone will be strengthened by the adoption by Ivrea Council of the regulation of the regional landscape plan, integrating the guidelines and prescriptions directly relating to the protection, safeguard and enhancement of the property into the municipal regulations by October 2019. The municipal technical service department directly responds to proposed projects and grants authorisations, taking account of national, regional and local designations for buildings and landscape (for the buffer zone).*

*Challenges to the long-term conservation of the Outstanding Universal Value of Ivrea arise in relation to the resourcing of conservation and the need for new uses throughout the city's elements. 44% of the former industrial and corporate buildings of the property are vacant or underused, and there are short-term needs for maintenance strategies. Engagement with residents and other users is an ongoing priority. Currently visitor levels are low, and there are plans to increase tourism capacity.*

*The Management Plan was updated in September 2017, and outlines a number of short and longer-term Action Plans for protection, conservation and documentation; capacity building; communication and education; and presentation. The management system includes a Steering Committee chaired by the Mayor; Technical Advisory Boards appointed by the Steering Committee; and the Site Coordinator. The General Secretary of the*

*Municipality of Ivrea is the operating representative who coordinates all the municipal departments involved in the delivery of the actions in the management plan. The Municipality of Banchette has signed a Memorandum of Understanding to implement the Management Plan in relation to the small area occurring within its boundaries.*

Property	Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica
State Party	Mexico
ID No.	1534 Rev
Date of inscription	2018

**Brief synthesis**

*The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán: originary habitat of Mesoamerica is located in central-southern Mexico, at the southeast of the State of Puebla and north of the State of Oaxaca. The property is a serial site of some 145,255 ha composed of three components: Zapotitlán-Cuicatlán, San Juan Raya and Purrón. All these share the same buffer zone of some 344,932 ha. The entire property is located within the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve. The property coincides with a global biodiversity hotspot and lies within an arid or semiarid zone with one of the highest levels of biological diversity in North America, giving rise to human adaptations crucial to the emergence of Mesoamerica, one of the cradles of civilisation in the world.*

*Of the 36 plant communities, 15 different xeric shrublands are exclusive to the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley. The valley includes representatives of a remarkable 70% of worldwide flora families and includes over 3,000 species of vascular plants of which 10% are endemic to the Valley. It is also a global centre of agrobiodiversity and diversification for numerous groups of plants, in which the cacti stand out, with 28 genera and 86 species of which 21 are endemic. Large "cacti-forests" shape some landscapes of the Valley making it one of the most unique areas in the world.*

*The property exhibits the impressively high levels of faunal diversity known in this region including very high levels of endemism among mammals, birds, amphibians and fish. It also hosts an unusually high number of threatened species with some 38 listed under the IUCN Red List of Threatened Species. The property is one of the richest protected areas in Mexico in terms of terrestrial mammals (134 species registered, two of them endemic to the Valley). The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley is part of the Balsas Region and Interior Oaxaca Endemic Bird Area (EBA). There are 353 bird species recorded, of which nine are endemic to Mexico. The property has eight known roosting*

areas of the threatened Green Macaw including a breeding colony.

The vast biodiversity of the Valley, combined with the adverse conditions of a desert, gave rise to one of the largest and best documented cultural sequences in the Americas. The archaeological evidence reveals the long sequence of human adaptations that took place in the area for over 12,000 years. The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley is an exceptional example of a long process of adaptations and ancient technological evolution that defined the cultural region known today as Mesoamerica.

The arid conditions of the Valley triggered innovation and creativity, originating two of the major technological advances of human history: 1) plant domestication, which in the Valley is one of the most ancient worldwide, and 2) development of water management technologies resulting in a wide array of water management elements, such as canals, wells, terraces, aqueducts and dams which make it the most diversified ancient irrigation complex of the continent. Consequently, water management technological features were the ruling guide for the civilisational process that was developed in the Valley throughout thousands of years. Furthermore, these technological advances had a multiplying effect and fostered the discovery of other innovations like salt industry and pottery, which were essential to the organisation and complexity of the first civilisations.

The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica is an invaluable and irreplaceable heritage of humanity.

**Criterion (iv):** The technological ensemble of water management of the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley, along with other archaeological evidences such as the remains found in caves, plant domestication sites and agriculture, use of wild species, salt ponds and pottery, mark a stage of the utmost importance for the Mesoamerican region: the appearance and development of one of the oldest civilisations in the world. Located throughout the Valley, these technologies bear unique evidence of the constant adaptation of humans to the environment and reflect their innovative capacity to face the adverse environmental conditions in the area.

**Criterion (x):** The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley demonstrates exceptional levels of biological diversity in an arid and semiarid zone in North America. A remarkable 70% of worldwide floral families are represented in the Valley, by at least one species, and the area is one of the main centres of diversification for the cacti family, which is highly threatened worldwide. A remarkable diversity of cacti exists within the property often in exceptional densities of up

to 1,800 columnar cacti per hectare. The property exhibits particularly high diversity among other plant types, namely the agaves, yuccas, bromeliads, bursera and oaks. Worldwide, it hosts one of the highest animal biodiversity levels in a dryland, at least with regard to taxa such as amphibians, reptiles and birds. The property coincides with one of the most important protected areas worldwide for the conservation of threatened species encompassing over 10% of the global distribution range of four amphibian species, and is ranked as the one of the two most important protected areas in the world for the conservation of seven amphibian and three bird species. The biodiversity of this region has a long history of sustaining human development and today a third of the total diversity of the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley, some 1,000 species, are used by local people.

### **Integrity**

The property is of sufficient overall size and contains the key representative habitats and plant communities of the floristic province Tehuacán-Cuicatlán and all the relevant cultural elements that convey its Outstanding Universal Value. The three components include relatively undisturbed areas of high conservation value and the 22 selected archaeological sites, and are embedded within a larger buffer zone all of which coincides with the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve. Further protection is afforded by the biosphere reserve's larger transitional zone.

The management systems in place addresses the various threats to the area and establish objectives, strategies and specific actions in coordination with key local, national and international stakeholders in order to deal with these threats, including any adverse effects of development.

### **Authenticity**

The component sites still maintain their original condition, with the obvious weathering deteriorating effects of time over millennia, but without any major disturbance in their main physical and spiritual attributes. Thanks to the investigation methods used, the sites are still unaltered and the system of sites as a whole has been preserved.

### **Protection and management requirements**

The property Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica has effective legal protection to ensure the maintenance of its Outstanding Universal Value. The archaeological sites not yet listed in the national registry of the National Institute for Anthropology and History (INAH), are in the process of being included. At the time of inscription the property had a recently updated Strategic Management Plan which aims to integrate the management of natural heritage with archaeological features through

a series of interrelated objectives. The plan provides a description of natural and cultural assets within the framework of a mixed World Heritage property and prescribes additional measures for the conservation and management of intangible cultural heritage, such as linguistic diversity and communities' sustainable development.

The institutions in charge of implementing protective measures are the Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources, the National Commission of Natural Protected Areas (CONANP), the Federal Attorney General for Environmental Protection and the National Institute of Anthropology and History (INAH). For monitoring of biodiversity the National Commission for Knowledge and Use of Biodiversity and the National Forestry Commission coordinate with CONANP. All these institutions work together with the Administration Office of the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve. Ongoing efforts are needed to ensure full integration and institutional coordination across issues related to natural and cultural heritage in accordance with the respective mandates of CONANP and INAH. The National Institute of Anthropology and History, through the National Coordination for Archaeology, is committed to provide the periodical reports on management, research and monitoring on cultural heritage. Both managing institutions are actively working with local communities and efforts to strengthen these approaches are ongoing.

In comparison to other regions the population density is low, and current and potential threats are considered to be quite limited as well. Tourism use at the time of inscription was relatively minimal, however, has the potential to grow rapidly. A Nature Tourism Strategy for the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve (2018-2023) seeks to balance the protection of the property's Outstanding Universal Value with fostering responsible visitation that empowers local communities. Priority needs to be given to the adaptive implementation of this strategy based on monitoring the impacts.

Property	Ancient City of Qalhat
State Party	Oman
ID No.	1537
Date of inscription	2018

### **Brief synthesis**

The Ancient City of Qalhat is located on the eastern coast of the Sultanate of Oman, approximately 20 kilometres north of the city of Sur. The property includes the entire Ancient City of Qalhat, demarcated by its inner and outer walls, which extends over 35 hectares, as well as areas outside the walls where the necropolises are situated.

The city was an important port on the sea of Oman along the East Arabian Coast, which allowed for trade with the Persian Gulf and the Indian Ocean and hence functioned as a trade centre between India and through it East and South East Asia and the Arabian Peninsula. Qalhat flourished in the 11th to 16th century CE under the ruling of the Princes of Hormuz, who coordinated vital exports of horses, dates, incense and pearls. Following Portuguese attacks, the Ancient city of Qalhat was abandoned in the 16th century and has since been preserved as an archaeological site. The remains and monuments on site comprehensively represent a port city of the Kingdom of Hormuz and reflect its legacy, architecture and urban design.

**Criterion (ii):** Qalhat exhibits the cultural and commercial interchange of values within the trading range of the Kingdom of Hormuz, which extended to India and as far as China and South East Asia. The archaeological site of Qalhat provides physical evidence of these interchanges, documenting the architectural features which indicate its own produce, dates, Arabian horses as well as spices and pearls but also integrating the multi-cultural features of a medieval cosmopolitan city, with houses influenced by the needs of their various owners and inhabitants of foreign cultural origin. The ancient city also includes a number of highly representative buildings which were references in narratives authored by historic travellers.

**Criterion (iii):** The Ancient City of Qalhat presents a unique testimony to the Kingdom of Hormuz, as it prospered from the 11th to 16th century CE. Ancient Qalhat presents exceptional evidence of a major trade hub, which came under the rule of the Princes of Hormuz and profited from its geo-political position in the region. It was a seasonal residence and refuge to the Princes of Hormuz, which has given it the title of a secondary capital of the larger kingdom. The urban plan and the excavated buildings of Qalhat show features and characteristics specific to the Kingdom of Hormuz and the archaeological remains are its most complete representation and provide further potential for a more detailed understanding of its ways of life and trade.

### **Integrity**

All key components of the Ancient City of Qalhat lie within the property boundaries, which include the entirety of the intra-muros city and the structures immediately outside the city wall. The remains of the walls and street fabric provide a representative testimony to the Kingdom of Hormuz, with the archaeological finds adding to our understanding of how it functioned.

The Ancient city of Qalhat is free of major threats, with the highway along the western side of the property being an unfortunate past intervention. It is important that future infrastructure and other developments in the

vicinity of the property avoid any negative impacts to the larger landscape qualities of the site. In case of future increased visitor numbers as result of new visitation concepts, Qalhat needs a controlled and managed tourist traffic to avoid any pressure and behaviour.

**Authenticity**

The Ancient city of Qalhat since its abandonment in the 16th century is an archaeological site. Its architectural and urban fabric and form remain authentic, almost untouched, as does its setting. The abandonment of the Ancient City of Qalhat plays a positive role in the conservation of its authenticity. The site has not been occupied since the 16th century and, therefore, it preserves all characteristics of organization, function and architectural techniques corresponding to the Islamic Period in general and the period of the Hormuz Kingdom in particular. Conservation, visitor management and site presentation plans aim at preserving this state to the largest extend possible.

Likewise, archaeological excavations have been well planned, thorough and minimal, an approach that should be commended and continued. Conservation works undertaken post-excavation will likewise be guided by minimum intervention approaches. The location of the Ancient City of Qalhat between the mountains, deep valleys and the sea is essential to its largely retained authenticity in setting. Authenticity in meaning is related both to the authenticated history of the site and to stories and myths associated with it, which will be respected within the overall management approach.

**Protection and management requirements**

The Ancient City of Qalhat is designated as a national cultural heritage site of Oman and is therefore under the highest legal level of protection of national heritage according to Royal Decree No. 6/80. The same Royal Decree also assures the protection of a buffer zone around the heritage sites concerned. The legal protection is effectively implemented by means of fencing and human guards patrolling the archaeological site. Before the property was closed to the public for conservation, the section of the site around Bibi Maryam was protected by the residents of the neighbouring village which was disrupted when the site was closed and visitation was discontinued. This guardianship tradition will be re-activated as part of the future visitor concept.

The administrative organization responsible for the protection and management is the Ministry of Heritage and Culture. The Directorate General of Archaeology as a part of the Ministry's Administrative structure looks after the day to day management of the site. A management plan was finalized and officially adopted in June 2018, which will guide the establishment of a strengthened management

unit and system on site. In light of the possible risks by earthquakes or other natural disasters this management system should integrate risk preparedness and disaster management strategies.

The property is currently closed to visitors for the purpose of continued excavation and conservation measures and no visitor infrastructure exists. While a reopening and with it a need for visitor infrastructure is envisaged, concrete plans for visitor infrastructure and services are yet to be developed. In light of this, Heritage Impact Assessments should be undertaken before any visitor infrastructure is approved within or around the property to prevent potential negative impacts to the Outstanding Universal Value.

Property	Sansa, Buddhist Mountain Monasteries in Korea
State Party	Republic of Korea
ID No.	1562
Date of inscription	2018

**Brief synthesis**

Sansa consists of seven Buddhist mountain monasteries—Tongdosa, Buseoksa, Bongjeongsa, Beopjusa, Magoksa, Seonamsa and Daeheungsa—located throughout the southern provinces of the Korean Peninsula. The seven monasteries established from the 7th to the 9th centuries have functioned as centres of religious belief, spiritual practice, and daily living of monastic communities, reflecting the historical development of Korean Buddhism. Sansa has accommodated diverse Buddhist schools and popular beliefs within its precinct, and many of its notable historic structures, halls, objects and documents reflect such assimilating features of Korean Buddhism. The distinctive intangible and historical aspects of Korean Buddhism can be recognized in the continuous traditions of self-sufficient temple management, education of monks, and coexistence of meditative practice and doctrinal studies of Korean Seon Buddhism. These mountain monasteries are sacred places, which have survived to the present as living centres of faith and religious practices despite suppression during the Joseon Dynasty and damages caused by wars and conflicts over the years.

**Criterion (iii):** Buddhism has a long history that has traversed a number of historical eras in the Korean Peninsula. The seven mountain monasteries – Tongdosa, Buseoksa, Bongjeongsa, Beopjusa, Magoksa, Seonamsa and Daeheungsa – offer a distinctively Korean instantiation of Buddhist monastic culture from the 7th century to the present day. These mountain monasteries are sacred places and provide an exceptional testimony to their long and continuing traditions of Buddhist spiritual practice.



### **Integrity**

Together the seven temples contain the elements necessary to express the Outstanding Universal Value of Korean Buddhist mountain monasteries, including their mountain settings, well-preserved buildings for religious practice and daily living, worship halls and shrines, meditation areas, monastic academy spaces and dormitories for monks. Few pressures threaten the components and they are intact, free of major losses and alterations during the modern period, and retain their original functions, despite changes through history.

### **Authenticity**

The authenticity of the serial property is based on the long and continuing uses of the components for Buddhist spiritual practices and rituals, and is based on their location and setting; traditions, techniques and management skills; and intangible heritage. The architectural elements have been carefully maintained according to principles of repair and restoration, using traditional construction techniques, although the function of some buildings have changed to support the operations of the temples. The religious traditions and functions of the Buddhist temples maintain a high degree of authenticity.

### **Protection and management requirements**

The seven temples are all being protected and managed as State or City/Province designated Cultural Heritage under the Cultural Heritage Protection Act. Modern constructions to facilitate continuing use and developments around the temples are strictly controlled. Each of the seven components is also protected by the Korean Traditional Temples Preservation and Support Act.

Cultural Heritage Zones and Historical and Cultural Environment Protection Zones established by the Cultural Heritage Protection Act are in place for each of the components and their buffer zones. The Cultural Heritage Protection Act applies within areas of 500-metres of the outer boundary of each Cultural Heritage Zone. Heritage Impact Assessments are prepared within the provisions of the Cultural Heritage Protection Act. Each temple has various designated elements (including artworks, relics and architecture) at the national or provincial level.

The 'Conservation and Management Plan for Sansa, Buddhist Monasteries in Korea' is in place, and the management system and conservation strategy will be overseen by 'Sansa Conservation and Management', with representation from religious and government authorities. Staff are provided for administration, conservation management, monitoring, research and promotion, as well as the monks, temple management staff, cultural heritage management staff and cultural tourism guides.

Each temple is under the responsibility of a chief abbot. The Cultural Heritage Administration and provincial governments are responsible for the management of cultural heritage, and the development and implementation of related projects. The Laity Association of each temple participates in volunteer work to support Buddhist practices, maintaining the temple landscapes and cleaning the temples. Visitor infrastructure is provided at each temple.

The Cultural Heritage Administration formulates comprehensive 5-year plans for the conservation and management of the temples in consultation with provincial governments. There is a Cultural Heritage Maintenance Plan for Buseoksa and Seonamsa temples, and plans for the remaining components will be established in 2018-2020.

Property	Aphrodisias
State Party	Turkey
ID No.	1519
Date of inscription	2017

### **Brief Synthesis**

Aphrodisias is located in southwestern Turkey, in the fertile valley formed by the Morsynus River, in the ancient region of Caria. The serial property consists of two components. The first component encompasses the archaeological site of Aphrodisias following the city walls that encircle the city; and the second component includes the marble quarries located northeast of the city. Aphrodisias was founded as a city-state in the early 2nd century BC. An orthogonal street grid defines the pattern of the city; only a few structures, such as the temple of the goddess Aphrodite, are not aligned with the grid. Because the city shared a close interest in the goddess Aphrodite with Sulla, Julius Caesar and the emperor Augustus, Aphrodisias came to have a close relationship with Rome. It obtained a privileged 'tax-free' political status from the Roman senate, and developed a strong artistic, sculptural tradition during the Imperial Period. Many elaborately decorated structures were erected during the period of Roman rule, all made from the local marble.

The Cult of Aphrodite was the most important cult of Aphrodisias. The sanctuary at Aphrodisias had a distinctive cult statue of Aphrodite which defined the city's identity. The Aphrodite of Aphrodisias combined aspects of a local Anatolian, archaic fertility goddess with those of the Hellenic Aphrodite, goddess of love and beauty. This identifying image has been found from Anatolia across the Mediterranean, from the city of Rome to the Levant. The importance of the Aphrodite of Aphrodisias continued well beyond official imperial

acceptance of Christianity; the Temple did not become a church until c. AD 500.

The proximity of the marble quarries to the city was a major reason that Aphrodisias became an outstanding high-quality production centre for marble sculpture. Sculptors from the city were famous throughout the Roman Empire. They were well-known for virtuoso portrait sculpture and Hellenistic-style statues of gods and Dionysian figures. In late antiquity (4th-6th centuries AD), Aphrodisian sculptors were in great demand for marble portrait busts and statues of emperors, governors and philosophers in the major centres of the empire – for example, at Sardis, Stratonikeia, Laodikeia, Constantinople and Rome. In this period they were the best carvers of marble statues of their day. The techniques used, the quality of local artistic design, and the production of advanced portrait sculpture gave Aphrodisias a unique place in the Roman world.

Another key aspect of Aphrodisias was its cosmopolitan social structure (Greek, Roman, Carian, pagan, Jewish, Christian) that is abundantly articulated in the site's 2,000 surviving inscriptions.

**Criterion (ii):** The exceptional production of sculpted marble at Aphrodisias blends local, Greek, and Roman traditions, themes and iconography. It is visible throughout the city in an impressive variety of forms, from large decorated architectural blocks to larger than life-size statues to small portable votive figures. The proximity of good quarries with both pure white and grey marbles was a strong catalyst for the swift development of the city as a noted centre for marble-carving and marble-carvers. The ability of Aphrodisian sculptors was sought after in metropolitan Rome where signatures of Aphrodisian sculptors appear on some of the finest surviving works – for example, from Hadrian's Villa at Tivoli. These sculptors were major participants in the Empire's art market between the 1st and 5th centuries AD.

**Criterion (iii):** Aphrodisias occupies a pre-eminent place in the study of sculpture in the Roman world. Its quarries and its sculpture workshops made it a major art centre, famous for the creativity and technical skill of its sculptors. Aphrodisias has one of the very few known and systematically excavated sculpture workshops of the Roman Empire, which provides a fuller understanding of the production of marble sculpture than anywhere else in the Roman world.

**Criterion (iv):** Aphrodisias is an exceptional example of the built environment of a Greco-Roman city in inland Asia Minor. Several of its monumental marble buildings have unique features in terms of architecture and design. The Sebasteion, an elaborate cult complex for the worship of Augustus and the Julio-Claudian emperors, represents a distinctive integration of Hellenistic, Roman and Aphrodisian artistic

traditions. The "Archive Wall" in the theatre is a well-preserved collection of official imperial documents regarding the status of the city under the Empire. The Theatre also features an early example of a stage building with an aediculated façade. The Stadium has an unusual architectural form with two curved ends, known as "amphitheatral", and is the best-preserved example of this type in the ancient world. The conversion of the Temple of Aphrodite into a cathedral, around AD 500, is unique among temple-to-church conversions in its engineering and transformative effect. The Tetracylon, the conspicuous entrance to the outer Sanctuary of Aphrodite, is preserved with its elaborate and exquisitely carved architectural ornament.

**Criterion (vi):** Aphrodisias was famous in antiquity as the cult centre of a version of Aphrodite which amalgamates aspects of an archaic Anatolian fertility goddess with those of the Hellenic goddess of love and beauty. The Aphrodite of Aphrodisias appears in marble figures from the site of Aphrodisias as well as from many other locations around the Mediterranean. This dissemination of the cult image is strong evidence of the regional and supra-regional importance of the cult.

#### **Integrity**

The property includes all elements necessary to express its values and has not suffered from significant geomorphological change or intensive human occupation since antiquity. The limits of the property ensure full representation of the attributes conveying the Outstanding Universal Value of both the city and the marble quarries. The property has been legally taken under control by the State, and appropriate policies and actions have been proposed within the conservation and management plans in order to sustain the integrity of the site.

#### **Authenticity**

The authenticity of the serial property is established through its quarries, monuments and sculptures, about 2,000 surviving inscriptions, a comprehensively studied history and a substantial body of published research. The work of conservation and restoration at Aphrodisias has been undertaken in conformity with the Charter of Venice, respecting their original designs and building materials. The landscape surrounding Aphrodisias has not been exposed to modern development or to mass tourism.

#### **Protection and management requirements**

Legal protection of the property has been provided by the Act on the Conservation of Cultural and Natural Property No. 2863 since 1978 for the ancient city and since 1981 for the quarries. By the decision No. 5580 of the Aydin Regional Conservation Council in 2016, legal protection has been strengthened for the quarries. Legal protection should be extended for the entirety of the buffer zone. The patrols by

the local gendarmerie should be expanded in order to include the quarry component as well as the buffer zone.

The Ministry of Culture and Tourism with its central and local branches and the excavation team are the main bodies responsible for the conservation, protection, promotion and management of the site. Integration of the local community into the management system of the property needs to be strengthened.

The archaeological site is excavated, researched and conserved by the excavation team which is authorized by the government on an annual basis, and its work is regularly monitored by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism.

A Conservation Plan for the city component was prepared, and approved by the Aydin Regional Conservation Council in 2002. A full 3D inventory of the quarry faces should be conducted in order to provide a baseline record of their condition. There is a need for formulation and implementation of monitoring indicators for the quarry component as well as implementation of remedial conservation measures.

The Aphrodisias Management Plan, prepared under the supervision of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism with the support of Geyre Foundation, was approved on 17 September 2013 and its implementation is followed by the Advisory Board and the Supervision and Coordination Board, as well as the site manager appointed by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. Both the conservation and management plans should be updated to reflect the extent of the property at the time of inscription.

Flooding in winter and wildfire in summer are the major natural risks to the property. For the prevention of flooding, a drainage plan within the walled city should be quickly implemented.

Also, a fire response plan and training in fire suppression should be developed. Mobile water tanks should be placed within the city during the summer as an interim measure until a permanent fire suppression system is installed.

Property	Göbekli Tepe
State Party	Turkey
ID No.	1572
Date of inscription	2018

**Brief synthesis**

Göbekli Tepe is located in Upper Mesopotamia, a region which saw the emergence of the most ancient farming communities in the world. Monumental structures, interpreted as monumental communal buildings (enclosures), were erected by groups of hunter-gatherers in

the Pre-Pottery Neolithic period (10th-9th millennia BC). The monuments were probably used in connection with social events and rituals and feature distinctive limestone T-shaped pillars, some of which are up to 5.50 meters tall. Some of the pillars, which are abstract depictions of the human form, also feature low reliefs of items of clothing, e.g. belts and loincloths, as well as high and low reliefs of wild animals. Recent excavation works have also identified the remains of non-monumental structures which appear to stem from domestic buildings.

**Criterion (i):** The communities that built the monumental megalithic structures of Göbekli Tepe lived during one of the most momentous transitions in human history, one which took us from hunter-gatherer lifeways to the first farming communities. The monumental buildings at Göbekli Tepe demonstrate the creative human genius of these early (Pre-Pottery Neolithic) societies.

**Criterion (ii):** Göbekli Tepe is one of the first manifestations of human-made monumental architecture. The site testifies to innovative building techniques, including the integration of frequently decorated T-shaped limestone pillars, which also fulfilled architectural functions. The imagery found at Göbekli Tepe, adorning T-pillars and some small finds (stone vessels, shaft-straighteners, etc.), is also found at contemporaneous sites in the Upper Mesopotamian region, thus testifying to a close social network in this core region of Neolithisation.

**Criterion (iv):** Göbekli Tepe is an outstanding example of a monumental ensemble of monumental megalithic structures illustrating a significant period of human history. The monolithic T-shaped pillars were carved from the adjacent limestone plateau and attest to new levels of architectural and engineering technology. They are believed to bear witness to the presence of specialized craftsmen, and possibly the emergence of more hierarchical forms of human society.

**Integrity**

Göbekli Tepe contains all the elements necessary for the expression of its Outstanding Universal Value and is of adequate size to ensure the complete presentation of the features and processes which convey its significance.

The physical fabric of the property is in good condition and the processes of deterioration are monitored and carefully controlled.

The conditions of integrity are potentially vulnerable in the buffer zone and wider setting of the property due to the future infrastructure projects (railway line) and the increase in visitor numbers likely to be generated.

**Authenticity**

The megalithic structures have largely retained the original form and design of their architectural elements, together with numerous decorative elements and craft works that provide an insight into the way of life of the societies that occupied the site. The results of more than twenty years of research and archaeological excavations on the site testify to its authenticity. Excavations and research under way since the mid-1990s also provide a more balanced and detailed view of the relationship between the various aspects of usage and the prehistoric importance of the property.

**Protection and management requirements**

Göbekli Tepe is legally protected by Law 2863/1983 on the Protection of the Cultural and Natural Properties, amended in 1987 and 2004. In 2005, the tell and the limestone plateau were inscribed as a 1st Degree Archaeological Conservation Site by the decision of the Diyarbakır Council for Conservation of Cultural and Natural Properties. In 2016, the buffer zone was registered as a 3rd Degree Archaeological Conservation Site, by the decision of the Şanlıurfa Council for Conservation of Cultural Properties.

The institutional framework for the implementation of the protection measures consists at national level of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, at regional level of the Şanlıurfa Council for Conservation of Cultural Properties, and at local level of Şanlıurfa Museum. Since 2014 the Ministry of Culture and Tourism has granted an excavation permit to Şanlıurfa Museum in collaboration with the German Archaeological Institute .

The property, its buffer zone and its wider setting are protected by a strict regime of maintenance and control, derived from extensive statutory protection and state ownership. The Ministry of Culture and Tourism, through the Şanlıurfa Museum and the German Archaeological Institute, has in place an effective system of monitoring of all the assets and their condition, which includes an ongoing maintenance programme.

The management plan was drawn up in 2013, revised in 2016 and finalised in 2017. Within the framework of the revised conservation legislation (Protection of Cultural and Natural Properties Law No.2863, 23/07/1983 as amended by the Law No.5226, 14/07/2004) and its supplementary Regulation on the Substance and Procedures of the Establishment and Duties of the Site Management and the Management Council and Identification of Management Sites No.26006, 27/11/2005, a site manager was appointed in 2014. An Advisory Board, set up in 2016, examines the management plan and submits proposals for decision-making and the implementation of the plan. A Coordination and Audit Board, also set

up in 2016, examines and approves the draft master plan.

## IV. STATEMENT OF OUTSTANDING UNIVERSAL VALUE OF MALOTI-DRAKENSBERG PARK (LESOTHO/SOUTH AFRICA), DECISION 41 COM 7B.38

### BACKGROUND

In its Decision **41 COM 7B.38** the World Heritage Committee at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017) requested the States Parties of Lesotho and South Africa to present a updated Statement of Outstanding Universal Value for the Maloti-Drakensberg Park World Heritage property, by incorporating the findings of the recent studies related to the cultural attributes of the property as mentioned in the decision.

The Statement is included below, and shows the slight amendments made to the text, not touching at all the criteria statements. The text is presented in the language in which it was submitted to the Secretariat.

### **Draft Decision: 43 COM 8B.55**

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/8B.Add,
2. Recalling Decision **41 COM 7B.38** adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3. Adopts the slightly updated Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of **Maloti-Drakensberg Park, Lesotho and South Africa**.

Property	Maloti-Drakensberg Park
States Parties	Lesotho, South Africa
ID No.	985 Bis
Date of inscription	2000, 2013

### **Brief Synthesis**

The Maloti-Drakensberg **Park** World Heritage Site is a transnational property spanning the border between the Kingdom of Lesotho and the Republic of South Africa. The property comprises Sehlabathebe National Park (6,500ha) in Lesotho and uKhahlamba Drakensberg Park (242,813 ha) in South Africa. Maloti-Drakensberg **Park** World Heritage Site is renowned for its spectacular natural landscape, importance as a haven for many threatened and endemic species, and for its wealth of rock paintings made by the San people over a period of 4000 years. The property covers an area of 249,313 ha making it the largest **Protected Area** complex along the Great Escarpment of **Southern Africa**.

The Maloti-Drakensberg **Park** range of mountains constitutes the principal water

production area in Southern Africa. The areas along the international border between the two countries create a drainage divide on the escarpment that forms the watershed for two of **Southern Africa's largest drainage basins**. The Thukela River from uKhahlamba Drakensberg Park flows eastwards into the Indian Ocean. The rivers of southern Maloti-Drakensberg including Sehlabathebe National Park drain into the Senqu/Orange River which flows westwards into the Atlantic Ocean extension of the uKhahlamba Drakensberg Park World Heritage Site to include Sehlabathebe National Park add special hydrologic qualities to the area. ~~The Senqu/Orange River from Sehlabathebe National Park flows westwards into the Atlantic Ocean.~~

With its pristine steep-sided river valleys and rocky gorges, the property has numerous caves and rock shelters containing an estimated **690** rock art sites, and the number of individual images in those sites probably exceeds 35,000. The images depict animals and human beings, and represent the spiritual life of the San people, representing an exceptionally coherent tradition that embodies their beliefs and cosmology over several millennia. There are also **Rock art** paintings dating back to the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, are attributable to Bantu speaking people.

Extending along most of KwaZulu-Natal's south-western border with Lesotho, the property provides a vital refuge for more than 250 endemic plant species and their associated fauna. It also holds almost all of the remaining subalpine and alpine vegetation in the KwaZulu-Natal **province**, including extensive high altitude wetlands above 2,750m and is a RAMSAR site. The **uKhahlamba Drakensberg Park** has been identified as an Important Bird Area, and forms a critical part of the Lesotho Highlands Endemic Bird Area.

**Criterion (i):** The rock art of the Maloti-Drakensberg Park is the largest and most concentrated group of rock paintings in Africa south of the Sahara and is outstanding both in quality and diversity of subject.

**Criterion (iii):** The San people lived in the mountainous Maloti-Drakensberg area for more than four millennia, leaving behind them a corpus of outstanding rock art, providing a unique testimony which throws much light on their way of life and their beliefs.

**Criterion (vii):** The site has exceptional natural beauty with soaring basaltic buttresses, incisive dramatic cutbacks and golden sandstone ramparts. Rolling high altitude grasslands, the

pristine steep-sided river valleys and rocky gorges also contribute to the beauty of the site.

**Criterion (x):** The property contains significant natural habitats for in situ conservation of biological diversity. It has outstanding species richness, particularly of plants. It is recognised as a Global Centre of Plant Diversity and endemism, and occurs within its own floristic region – the Drakensberg Alpine Region of South Africa. It is also within a globally important endemic bird area and is notable for the occurrence of a number of globally threatened species, such as the Yellow-breasted Pipit. The diversity of habitats is outstanding, ranging across alpine plateaux, steep rocky slopes and river valleys. These habitats protect a high level of endemic and threatened species.

### **Integrity**

The uKhahlamba Drakensberg Park, composed of 12 protected areas established between 1903 and 1973 has a long history of effective conservation management. Covering 242,813 ha in area, it is large enough to survive as a natural area and to maintain natural values. It includes four (4) proclaimed Wilderness areas almost 50% of the Park, while largely unaffected by human development, the property remains vulnerable to external land uses including agriculture, plantation forestry and ecotourism, although agreements between Ezemvelo Kwa-Zulu Natal Wildlife and local stakeholders have been implemented to manage these threats.

Invasive species, fire, infrastructural developments, soil erosion, tourist impacts on vulnerable alpine trails, and poaching also threaten the integrity of the site. The lack of formal protection of the mountain ecosystem over the border in Lesotho (beyond the buffer zone of Sehlabathebe National Park) exacerbates these threats.

Boundary issues highlighted at time of inscription included the gap belonging to the amaNgwane and amaZizi Traditional Council between the northern and much larger southern section of the Park. There are planning mechanisms that restrict development above the 1,650m contour to maintain ecological integrity. Processes are underway to develop a cooperative agreement between the amaNgwane and amaZizi Traditional Council and Ezemvelo Kwa Zulu-Natal Wildlife. Extending conservation areas by agreements with privately-owned land along the escarpment to the south of the property is recommended. An important step to strengthening integrity has been the development of the Maloti-Drakensberg Transfrontier Conservation and Development Area (MDTFCA), which has recognised the importance of a Transboundary Peace Park linking the Sehlabathebe National Park in Lesotho with uKhahlamba Drakensberg Park. Project Coordinating Committees in both KwaZulu-Natal and Lesotho are cooperating in a planning process. The SNP (6,500ha) has

been protected since 1970 as a wildlife sanctuary and a national park, and gazetted in 2001, to enhance protection of the biodiversity and scenic qualities of the property. The extension to include SNP has enhanced protection of the biodiversity and cultural values of the property.

The property contains the main corpus of rock art related to the San people in this area. A comparatively high concentration of rock art sites seems present in the western buffer zone in Lesotho and future surveys of these should be undertaken to judge their potential contribution to the Outstanding Universal Value. Although the area has changed relatively little since the caves were inhabited, management practices, such as the removal of trees (which formerly sheltered the paintings) and the smoke from burning grass both have the capacity to impact adversely on the fragile images of the rock shelters, as does unregulated public access.

### **Authenticity**

The synthesis of rock art sites and their natural setting in the Maloti-Drakensberg Park convey a very strong sense of authenticity in setting, location and atmosphere but also material, substance and workmanship. It should be noted as a positive factor that in large parts of the property no systematic conservation or consolidation treatment has been attempted, which has left the rock art sites perhaps more fragile, but with the utmost possible degree of authenticity. The sites remain closely integrated with their surrounding landscape and credibly convey the narratives of San life and activity in respect to the harsh climatic conditions of the area and necessary exploitation of natural resources and shelter. This San rock art tradition does not terminate at the end of the Late Stone Age but continues, and is expressed at sites associated with both Khoi and Iron Age Peoples. Potential influences of UV rays and weathering on the images could lead to fading of colors and reduce the clarity of image content, which in turn could lessen their ability to display their meaning. It is important that explanatory materials assist the interpretation of the image content as understood by the San people.

### **Protection and management requirements**

Management of the Park is guided by an Integrated Management Plan with subsidiary plans, and is undertaken in accordance with the World Heritage Convention Act, 1999 (South Africa, Act No. 49 of 1999); National Heritage Resources Act, 1999 (South Africa, Act No. 25 of 1999); National Environmental Management: Protected Areas Act, 2003 (South Africa, Act No. 57 of 2003); National Environmental Management Biodiversity Act, 2004 (South Africa, Act No 10 of 2004); KwaZulu-Natal Nature Conservation Management Amendment Act (South Africa, Act No 5 of 1999); the Game Preservation Proclamation (Lesotho, Act No. 55

of 1951); the Historical Monuments, Relics, Fauna and Flora Act (Lesotho, [Act No. 41 of 1967](#)); the National Heritage Act 2011 and Environment Act (Lesotho, [Act No. 10 of 2008](#)); World Heritage Convention Operational Guidelines; Environment policies in Lesotho and Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife policies. In terms of these legislation, all development within the property [or within its buffer zone](#) is subjected to an Environmental Impact Assessment and Heritage Impact Assessments respectively, which consider the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. In addition all World Heritage Sites are recognized as [Protected Areas](#), meaning that mining or prospecting will be completely prohibited from taking place within the property or the proclaimed buffer zone. Furthermore, any unsuitable development with a potential impact on the property will not be permitted by the South African and Lesotho [Ministers responsible for Environment and Culture](#).

Invasive species and fire are major management challenges. This poses a threat to the ecological integrity of the Park as well as to the yield of water from its wetlands and river systems. The interaction between the management of invasive species and the management of fire should also be carefully considered, taking into account the effects of fire on fire-sensitive fauna such as endemic frogs. Management of fire and invasive species needs [is being](#) addressed jointly by Lesotho and [South Africa](#), ideally within the framework established for transboundary protected area cooperation.

There is a need to ensure an equitable balance between the management of nature and culture through incorporating adequate cultural heritage expertise into the management of the [World Heritage property](#) and providing the responsible cultural heritage authorities with adequate budgets for the inventory, conservation and monitoring tasks. This shall ensure that all land management processes respect the paintings, that satisfactory natural shelter is provided to the rock art sites, that monitoring of the rock art images is conducted on a regular basis by appropriately qualified conservators, and that access to the paintings is adequately regulated. Furthermore, there is a need to ensure that Heritage Impact Assessments are undertaken in conjunction with Environmental Impact Assessments for any proposed development affecting the setting within the property.